

"In the Glory of the Sunset": Arthur Farwell, Charles Wakefield Cadman, and Indianism in American Music

Beth E. Levy

Although the portrayal of Native Americans in Euro-American art does not begin with Longfellow's *Song of Hiawatha* (1855), it would be difficult to overestimate the importance of this narrative poem in shaping later nineteenth- and early twentieth-century representations of Indian life. Generations of school children have memorized and chanted its infectious lines:

Should you ask me, whence these stories,
Whence these legends and traditions,
With the odors of the forest,
With the dew and damp of meadows,
With the curling smoke of wigwams,
With the rushing of great rivers,
With their frequent repetitions,
And their wild reverberations,
As of thunder in the mountains?
I should answer, I should tell you,
"From the forests and the prairies,
From the great lakes of the Northland,
From the land of the Ojibways,
From the land of the Dacotahs,
From the mountains, moors, and fen-lands
Where the heron, the Shuh-shuh-gah,
Feeds among the reeds and rushes.
I repeat them as I heard them
From the lips of Nawadaha,
The musician, the sweet singer."

.....
"There he sang of Hiawatha,
Sang the Song of Hiawatha,
Sang his wondrous birth and being,
How he prayed and how he fasted,

How he lived, and toiled, and suffered,
That the tribes of men might prosper,
That he might advance his people!"

.....
Ye who love a nation's legends,
Love the ballads of a people,
That like voices from afar off
Call to us to pause and listen,
Speak in tones so plain and childlike,
Scarcely can the ear distinguish
Whether they are sung or spoken;—
Listen to this Indian Legend,
To this Song of Hiawatha!¹

Hiawatha was coupled with ethnographic studies, it was translated into Latin (presumably for student use), it was parodied by Lewis Carroll, among others, and actresses gave public recitals of its most popular passages. Dozens of painters offered their depictions of Longfellow's characters.² A host of composers took their inspiration from his text, resulting in products ranging from Samuel Coleridge Taylor's memorable *Wedding of Hiawatha* (1898) or Rubin (nephew of Carl) Goldmark's *Hiawatha Overture* (1900) to the *Hiawatha Songster* (1903), or even the "Hiawatha" Schottische (1894).³ Unlikely as it may seem, the legendary chief who united the six tribes of the Iroquois had become an important part of American cultural imagination around the turn of the twentieth century, particularly for those eager to create overtly American art.

Longfellow himself had been engaged in such a project: *The Courtship of Miles Standish* followed *Hiawatha* by three years, and *Tales of a Wayside Inn*—including the famous

1. Henry Wadsworth Longfellow, "Hiawatha" with Its Original Indian Legends, Compiled with Essays on Its Authentic Background of Lake Superior Country and Chippewa Indians, ed. Chase S. Osborn and Stellanova Osborn (Lancaster, PA: Jaques Cattell, 1944), 62-65.

2. See Cynthia D. Nickerson, "Artistic Interpretations of Henry Wadsworth Longfellow's *The Song of Hiawatha*, 1855-1900," *Art in America* 16, no. 3 (1984): 49-77.

"Paul Revere's Ride"—appeared five years after that. As Michael Kammen notes in his *Mystic Chords of Memory: The Transformation of Tradition in American Culture*, "Longfellow took inchoate traditions and transformed them into memorable poetic narratives that millions mistook for history."⁴ Kammen's formulation calls attention to two important features of Longfellow's work as national art: it is both memorable and in some sense misleading in its relationship to history. I would like to touch on three additional aspects of the poem more specifically related to its manipulation of Native American materials before examining similar elements in the works of Arthur Farwell (1872-1952) and Charles Wakefield Cadman (1881-1946), two composers often associated with the appropriation of Indian musics. Each of these three themes carries its own attendant irony, each helped to inform the attitudes of Farwell and Cadman, and each continues to influence self-consciously American art even today.

Conveniently for Longfellow's Caucasian compatriots, the stories and legends he describes do not spring from anything as messy as blood or as time-consuming as a shared language or shared traditions. Although Longfellow repeats the stories "as [he] heard them, / From the lips of

3. In his recent article, "Edward MacDowell: Musical Nationalism and an American Tone Poet," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 49 (1996): 528-60, Richard Crawford addresses MacDowell's "Indian" Suite and his plans for a tone poem based on *Hiawatha*. Others participating in the *Hiawatha* phenomenon before 1930 include Charles Crozat Converse (c.1856), Emile Karst (1858), Robert Stoepel (1863), Frederick Russell Burton (1898), Hugo Kaun (1902), Rosseter G. Cole (1904), Sadie Knowland Coe (1905), Carl Busch (1907), Arthur Foote (1914), Bessie Whitely (1914), and Ira B. Wilson (1926). Neil Moret, Charles N. Daniels, and others introduced the *Hiawatha* legend into commercially popular music including the "Hiawatha" Waltz (1919) and the "Hiawatha" Polka (c.1856).

4. Michael Kammen, *The Mystic Chords of Memory* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1991), 82. Related discussion appears on pages 82-87.

Nawadaha, / The musician, the sweet singer," it is not the singer who gets credit for their origin. Rather, the poem suggests, the legends emanate unbidden "From the forests and the prairies, / From the great lakes of the Northland," or, more specifically, from the land of the Ojibway and the land of the Dakota—lands that were gradually ceded to the United States government during the three decades between the publication of *Hiawatha* and Longfellow's death. This emphasis on land is crucial and perhaps unavoidable in constructing the nationalism of a non-ethnic nation.⁵ Where blood is not an option, soil must suffice. The poem's figural erasing of Nawadaha, however, has a real and bloody historical counterpart in the forced removals of Native Americans throughout the nineteenth century as the United States raced westward to fulfil the "manifest destiny" it had claimed for itself.

The second of my themes is evident both in Longfellow's manner of presentation and his choice of subject matter: this is the desire for simplicity. The "plain and child-like" tones or "frequent repetitions" referred to in the poem could be comments on Longfellow's own style: straightforward and easily remembered. But of course these features are not as "natural" as Longfellow seems to suggest. They are carefully and self-consciously crafted: effective, artificial, and based not on any American original but on the metrical patterns of the Finnish *Kalevala*.⁶ A similar point could be made about the apparent simplicity of Native American life as Longfellow presents it. Until the poem's

5. For more on this American fascination, see Roderick Nash's wide-ranging *Wilderness and the American Mind* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967), chapters 6 and 7 of James Oliver Robertson's *American Myth, American Reality* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1980), and Patricia Nelson Limerick's "Disorientation and Reorientation: The American Landscape Discovered from the West," in *Discovering America: Essays on the Search for an Identity*, ed. David Thelen and Frederick E. Hoxie (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1994), 187-215.

closing lines, with their awkward shift into real, historical time and the surprising arrival of white missionaries, Longfellow escapes from the complexities of mid-nineteenth-century racial relations by retreating into the quasi-mythical time of sagas and ballads. By doing so, he dodges sticky issues of representation. However, when the image of the childlike Native American, so well solidified in *Hiawatha* and so widely disseminated through the poem's popularity, is applied not to "voices from afar off" but to living Native Americans, that is, as soon as this image receives ethnographic and political support, then the incomprehensibility of the half-sung, half-spoken tones no longer indicates a charming quaintness, but assumes an immediacy signaling a failure of interracial understanding with potentially frightening consequences.

The ironies of basing national art on stolen land and studied simplicity are matched if not surpassed by the inconsistencies that arise in connection to my third theme. That theme, or conjunction of themes, is a constellation of contradictions whose most typical symbol is the defeated warrior, the suffering hero, militant yet powerless. This construction became crucially important for Indianist art later in the nineteenth century, though it is only subtly apparent in this particular passage of Longfellow's poem. In this passage, *Hiawatha's* noble suffering is presented as martyrdom for an Indian cause: "How he prayed and how he fasted, / How he lived, and toiled, and suffered, / That the tribes of men might prosper, / That he might advance

6. Dana Gioia notes that Longfellow's insistent trochaic tetrameter, along with his adoption of Ojibway words, acts as "an overt distancing device," "continuously remind[ing] the listener that *Hiawatha's* mythic universe is not our own." "Longfellow in the Aftermath of Modernism," in *The Columbia History of American Poetry*, ed. Jay Parini (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), 88. Gioia also provides a valuable discussion of the vagaries of Longfellow's reception.

his people!" As long as the suffering of Hiawatha benefits his own people, it can be admirable. But this image is easily skewed if suffering becomes a sign not of sacrifice but of defeat. Respect for a defeated warrior quickly collapsed into maudlin pity for the last members of a dying race, glorifying not Native American stoicism but White America victorious.

Hiawatha raises crucial interpretive issues as well: How should the critic deal with a text that seems so innocent of the myriad ironies it encapsulates? How seriously can one interrogate incongruities which often seem at least unsophisticated if not ridiculous? In many ways these are the same critical questions that arise in dealing with Arthur Farwell and Charles Wakefield Cadman, two of the composers most associated with Indianism, or the appropriation of Native American material for Euro-American art. In addition, their music and writings provide numerous illustrations and modifications of the ironies discussed above—in many ways, Farwell and Cadman operated within even richer contexts of contradiction and oversimplification than Longfellow had. Though these two composers shared many concerns and assumptions, they are not often considered together. They achieved their reputations in different historiographical categories: Farwell is portrayed as radical, idealistic, and progressive, while Cadman appears as flexible, commercially successful, and nostalgic. In what follows, I will examine some of the different approaches and common ground underlying these composers' responses to the problems of creating a national music for America.⁷

• • •

Farwell's best-known enterprise, the Wa-Wan Press, solidified his reputation as an American musical hero even

during his lifetime. After returning from study abroad and finding no ready publisher for his compositions and those of his American colleagues, Farwell took matters into his own hands. As he later remarked, "Either American composers must inspire some one else to build up this work or they must do it themselves."⁸ The latter was evidently the easier project, and so the Wa-Wan Press came into being in 1901. While it is easy enough to detect a certain lack of altruism in the story of the Press's inception, Farwell's extreme personal and financial commitments earned him repeated encomiums. In 1903, Lawrence Gilman called the Press "probably the most determined, courageous, and enlightened endeavor to assist the cause of American music that has yet been made." John Tasker Howard echoed Gilman's praise in 1931 by ascribing to the Press "a tremendous influence" in "the awakening of American interest in the folk-song on our soil."⁹

7. For a thorough treatment of Indianism in music, I refer readers to Michael Pisani's work "Exotic Sounds in the Native Land" (Ph.D. diss., University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, 1996), forthcoming in publication from University of Illinois Press. Unfortunately, I acquired Pisani's work too late to incorporate it into the present paper. I am, however, grateful to Judy Tsou for bringing it to my attention. I have also benefited from insights presented by Tara Browner in her "'Breathing the Indian Spirit': Issues of Musical Borrowing in American Music," given at the 1994 meeting of the American Musicological Society (27-30 October, Minneapolis). See also her dissertation, "Transposing Cultures: The Appropriation of Native North American Musics, 1890-1990" (University of Michigan, 1995).

8. From Farwell, "A Letter to American Composers," 1903; cited in Gilbert Chase's introductory essay, "The Wa-Wan Press: A Chapter in American Enterprise," in *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, vol. 1, ed. Vera Brodsky Lawrence (New York: Arno Press, 1970), xviii.

9. Lawrence Gilman, "Some American Music," *Harper's Weekly* (7 March 1903); John Tasker Howard, *Our American Music* (New York: Thomas Crowell, 1931), 441-42. Cited in Edward N. Waters, "The Wa-Wan Press: An Adventure in Musical Idealism," in *A Birthday Offering to Carl Engel*, ed. Gustave Reese (New York: G. Schirmer, 1943), 230-31.

During the decade of the Press's independent activity, before it was granted to G. Schirmer in 1912, the Wa-Wan introduced works of some thirty-seven composers, offering vocal and instrumental pieces in alternating issues.¹⁰ With the exception of Charles Martin Loeffler, few established figures took significant interest in the Press, and even Loeffler chose to publish his own works elsewhere. Most of the composers who did take advantage of this new outlet were relatively young and often unpublished—Frederic Ayres, John Parsons Beach, Henry Gilbert, Edgar Stillman Kelley, Harvey Worthington Loomis, and Arthur Shepherd, to name a few. Others, like Carlos Troyer, had long-standing interests in American folk musics and found the Wa-Wan a welcoming venue for their efforts.¹¹

The name "Wa-Wan," taken from an Omaha word meaning approximately "to sing to someone," indicates the Press's particular interest in pieces drawing upon Native American themes. Composers like Troyer (and, of course, like Farwell himself) benefited from this aspect of the Wa-Wan philosophy. Yet Farwell was almost always careful to emphasize the inclusiveness of his project. His description of the Press's criteria for publication maintains a careful balance between Indianist and more general concerns:

There were two major departments of our plan. One comprised all American work showing talent or progress along any of the paths of musical tradition. The other comprised all interesting or worthwhile work done with American folk-material as a basis. Salability had

10. From 1901 to 1906, issues appeared twice quarterly; 1907 saw a brief increase to a monthly schedule, after which publication was erratic.

11. Troyer's adaptation of a Zuni "Festive Sun-Dance" may be the most often heard of his works: it was adopted by Puccini as Jake Wallace's "Che farranno i vecchi miei," in Act I of *La Fanciulla del West*. For details, see Allan W. Atlas's enviably titled article, "Belasco and Puccini: 'Old Dog Tray' and the Zuni Indians," *Musical Quarterly* 75 (1991): 362-98. See also Farwell, "The Music of Puccini's Opera," *Musical America* 13 (17 December 1910): 4-5.

nothing to do with the matter whatsoever. Of course we could not keep out occasional unimportant fillers, while we were working exclusively with a periodical series. We simply wanted to show that there were composers in America (i.e. Americans) and that they were making progress, whatever their tendencies.¹²

Farwell's simultaneous idealism and defensiveness also carried a strong anti-establishment message. He took pains to protect the press from detractors: "A word to critical persons. The Wa-Wan Press does not represent itself as a collection of masterpieces. It does not aim to be that which critics praise. It does not propitiate the gods of traditional culture. It does not seek to elevate the masses. It respects no coterie. It does not attempt to 'cover mediocrity with a cloak of patriotism.' It is not a financial scheme masquerading as a 'noble cause'." What the Wa-Wan was, according to Farwell, was an organization "to do Work for American music."¹³ As this citation suggests, the Press was only one part of Farwell's vision for American music, one branch of a much larger agenda that included grass-roots organizations for composers, elaborate community pageants, and an overall democratization of American musical life.

The Wa-Wan Press gave Farwell a means to air this agenda. He wrote editorial introductions to nearly every issue in the Press's early years, and he continued until the mid-forties to contribute to dozens of musical and non-musical journals, which provided a forum for his opinions on subjects ranging from Beethoven and spirituality to American opera to "Hitler's Intuitions."¹⁴ I will discuss

12. Cited in Waters, "The Wa-Wan Press," 219.

13. Farwell, "Introduction," *The Wa-Wan Press* 3, no. 19 (1904); reprinted in volume 2 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 153.

14. A wider range of Farwell's philosophy is discussed by Thomas Stoner in "'The New Gospel of Music': Arthur Farwell's Vision of Democratic Music in America," *American Music* 9 (1991): 183-208, and in his Introduction to the essay collection *"Wanderjahre of a Revolutionist" and Other Essays on American Music* (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 1995), 1-24.

only a few of the ideas most relevant to his Indianist compositions, and these only briefly.

Farwell's use of Native American materials took place within the larger framework of a search for an American musical identity. Though he denied being a "nationalist,"¹⁵ he was very much concerned with the cultivation of specifically American art. The main hindrance to this project, Farwell argued, was an overwhelmingly and exclusively German influence on American musical life:

The first obstacle to our truer vision has the dangerous quality of being so large that it is difficult to see. This is, that since our national musical education, both public and private, is almost wholly German, we inevitably, and yet unwittingly, see everything through German glasses.... The result of this to-day is that the German quality in music, dominating our whole musical life, has made it almost impossible for any other quality to gain recognition.... Therefore the first correction we must bring to our musical vision is to cease to see everything through German spectacles, however wonderful, however sublime those spectacles may be in themselves!¹⁶

Farwell's resistance to German influence was not without predictable exceptions, however, especially when he could point to a composer's incorporation of folk influence (which he almost always could): Thus, "Beethoven demonstrated, and Wagner both insisted and demonstrated, that the greatest music must eventually arise from a Folk." And again, "No one has penetrated more deeply than Wagner himself, the nature of the folk-spirit, nor drawn more freely from the wealth of folk-expression."¹⁷

Beethoven and Wagner aside, Farwell suggested at least two ways of removing the sublime German spectacles. The

15. Farwell, "National Work vs. Nationalism," *New Music Review* (July 1909), cited in Evelyn Davis Culbertson, *He Heard America Singing: Arthur Farwell, Composer and Crusading Music Educator* (Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press, 1992), 101-02.

16. Farwell, "Introduction," *Wa-Wan Press* 2, no. 15 (1903); reprinted in volume 2 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 64-65.

first involved an increased awareness of contemporary French and Russian models; the second required a familiarity with one particular Czech model. Looking back on his earlier compositional career in 1935, Farwell stated: "I had taken Dvořák's challenge deeply to heart, and worked in the field of Indian music, not with the idea that this or any other non-Caucasian folk music existing in America was the foundation of a national art, but because it existed only in America and its development was part of my program to further all unique and characteristic musical expressions that could come only from this country."¹⁸

Farwell's relationship to Native American music was complex. First, this music was a tool for the construction of his national program, as he noted, again in 1935: "The Indian music, because of its novelty, became a powerful weapon of propaganda; it enabled me to reach large numbers of people. Indeed I could not have made this national campaign without it."¹⁹ Second, Farwell found or forged many links between what he perceived in Native American culture and his own personal philosophy, especially regarding spirituality and the need for national rebirth. "Indian music," he claimed, "springs from, and interprets in new colors, the 'great mystery,' the eternal miracle of natural and human phenomena, to which refreshing source

17. Farwell, "The Struggle Toward a National Music," *North American Review* 186 (1907): 567; "Introduction," *Wa-Wan Press* 1, no. 4 (1902), reprinted in volume 1 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 76. Farwell's idolization of Wagner led him to some unusual formulations: "Wagner understood the spirit of America, and very seriously thought of coming here at a time when his own land repudiated him. He was more of an American than many of our own composers, for he worked with the primal forces of man and nature, and not with the over-refined and pre-digested delicacies of a decadent culture." "Struggle Toward a National Music," 569.

18. Farwell, "Pioneering for American Music," *Modern Music* 12 (March-April 1935): 117.

19. *Ibid.*, 119.

American life is leading us back from the artificialities and technicalities which have latterly beset European culture." Third, in his essay "An Affirmation of American Music" (1903), Farwell revealed his belief that Indian music was an inevitable component of American musical expression:

Any student of history and ethnology knows that an invading race must always finally be repulsed, or absorb into itself the life and characteristics of the conquered nation. As for the Indians, it is not to be supposed that an American art is to be gained by a trivial and pedantic copying of their rhythms and songs; but because we have conquered them, mingled with them (to an extent not dreamed of by the dwellers in our Eastern cities), been thrilled in turn by the land which thrilled them, we will inevitably have inhaled great draughts of their splendid optimism and faith, their freedom of spirit and largeness of feeling, and their power to appropriate nature's teeming stores of energy. This is not only a poetic but also a scientific fact.²⁰

The incorporation of Native American influences into American music was, in Farwell's view, not a matter of choice, but simply a matter of time. The thrill of the land, facilitated by the subjugation and relocation of its original inhabitants, was both necessary and sufficient to inspire a truly American art.

One of the earliest offerings of the Wa-Wan Press was Farwell's set of *American Indian Melodies* (1901). All but one of these songs were drawn from anthropologist Alice Fletcher's *Indian Story and Song from North America*, a volume that presents some of the Native American melodies Fletcher collected in her fieldwork, harmonized by John Comfort Fillmore, and coupled with stories and legends relevant to each song (example 1).²¹ Farwell's setting of "The Old Man's Love Song" relies so heavily on Fillmore's that,

20. Farwell, "An Affirmation of American Music," *Musical World* (January 1903): 11; reprinted in Gilbert Chase's collection *The American Composer Speaks* ([Baton Rouge]: Louisiana State University Press, 1966), 88-93. This argument is repeated in the "Introduction," *Wa-Wan Press* 2, no. 15 (1903); reprinted in volume 2 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 64-67.

Solibitum. Flowingly, With feeling.

Ha he ha ha he ha he ha we dhe ha dha e ha dhoe.

Um-ba e-don ha-kdon, hu-wi-ne ha, ho e ho wa dho he dhe, I ha,

Red * Red * Red * Red *

Example 1a: "The Old Man's Love Song," as harmonized by Fillmore, mm. 1-14 [Fletcher, *Indian Story and Song* (1900)].

Flowingly. ♩. 104 to 96

p *dim.* *p* *p*

poco rit.

Red Red Red Red * Red

Red Red Red Red Red Red Red Red *

Example 1b: "The Old Man's Love Song," as harmonized by Farwell, mm. 1-13 [Wa-Wan Press, 1901].

at first glance, it is difficult to say whether it qualifies as a new composition at all. Farwell was strictly faithful to Fillmore's choice of key signature, meter, and rhythmic notation, adding only expressive and dynamic markings. His intensification of Fillmore's bland harmonic vocabulary will be discussed below.

Farwell was by no means the first American to draw his melodic material from ethnographic sources; in 1891, for example, MacDowell had used Theodore Baker's *Über die Musik der nordamerikanischen Wilden* (Leipzig, Breitkopf und Härtel, 1882) as a source for several of the themes of his "Indian" Suite.²² But Farwell may have been the first to advertise both his debt to such sources and his manner of departing from them. As if to compensate for his puritanically literal borrowing of melodic material, he dramatized his initial encounters with Fletcher's *Indian Story and Song* by calling attention to his own creative process:

In this book were a number of Indian legends of the greatest beauty, full of poetry, of imagination, of dignity and nobility of thought. Corresponding to these were a number of songs which, in the harmonic setting which they bore, were an enigma to the writer. They seemed to him, at the time, to fail in bearing out the remarkable qualities exhibited by the legends. After the lapse of a year, however, believing that the Indian was incapable of an art-expression lacking in vital significance, he returned to these melodies, singing them repeatedly to himself without the harmonies which accompanied them, and which seemed to him too general in character to bear out the special significance of the different melodies. In this way new

21. Alice Fletcher, *Indian Story and Song from North America* (Boston: Small, Maynard & Company, 1900). For more information on Fletcher and her work among the Omaha and other tribes, see Joan Mark, *A Stranger in Her Native Land* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988). Fillmore's work is discussed by James McNutt in "John Comfort Fillmore: A Student of Indian Music Reconsidered," *American Music* 2, no. 1 (1984): 61-70; see also Hewitt Pantaleoni's response and McNutt's reply in *American Music* 3 (1985): 217-31.

22. See Francis Brancaleone, "Edward MacDowell and Indian Motives," *American Music* 7 (1989): 359-81, and Crawford, "Edward MacDowell," especially 551-60.

harmonies suggested themselves, which he recorded and developed in accordance with the growth of his insight into the Indian character.²³

Farwell's new harmonies, then, sprang from a desire to reflect the particularity of each song, to save the melodies from Fillmore's "elementary harmonies," and to allow them the "heightened art value" which he saw as crucial to their success. In particular, Farwell objected to the closure Fillmore provided at the end of the first line (where Farwell avoids even the half cadence) and to the static setting of bars 7-9 (which Farwell enlivens through bass arpeggiation and a chromatic alteration). In general, he explains, "we are driven to chromatics and modern effects in harmony in order to represent those various feelings characterizing, for the Indian himself, the various emotions underlying the different songs."²⁴ Significantly, in both of the passages quoted above, Farwell's "insight into the Indian character" comes not from any kind of contact with Native Americans, but rather from personal intuition (heavily influenced by Europe's harmonic norms) and isolated immersion in the song as artifact.²⁵

Farwell was not entirely without ethnological scruples, nor even without ethnological experience. He made a great many transcriptions of Native American songs for the Southwest Society of the Archaeological Institute during the summer of 1904—though even this did not require him to work with any Native Americans. To a much greater extent than many of his Indianist colleagues, especially Cadman, Farwell advocated familiarity with Native American customs and fidelity to their "underlying meaning":

23. Farwell, "Aspects of Indian Music," *Southern Workman* 31 (1902): 212.
24. *Ibid.*, 214.

25. Farwell had a near-fanatic, lifelong interest in personal intuition and mysticism culminating in his unpublished book *Intuition in the World Making* but also apparent in many of his articles, including "Sonata Form and the Cabbala," *Musical Quarterly* 27 (1941): 26-37.

There must be a clear understanding of the folly of any attempt to produce great results without including the religious, legendary or life significance underlying the songs. Any attempt on the part of composers to use the mere notes of the melodies detached from their generating ideas, will lead only to a barren reproduction of the old musical forms, disguised with new colors which have in themselves no vitalizing power.²⁶

But Farwell's means of coming to understand the significance of the songs was decidedly not ethnographic—more a reflection of his enthusiastic mystical beliefs than an attempt at empirical observation. In fact, in the Introduction to the issue in which his *American Indian Melodies* first appeared, Farwell went so far as to suggest that direct influence from Native Americans can actually keep one from grasping the song's "essential" message:

[Fillmore's] harmonies, however, have been determined partly by the Indian's preference, but more particularly by the tonal structure of the melodies themselves, of which Professor Fillmore made a deep and scientific study. It struck the writer, however, that a heightened art-value could be imparted to them, if the composer should consult, not merely this melodic structure, but the poetic nature of the particular legend or incident of which each song was the outcome.... If the musical imagination could be fired by a consideration of the particular legend pertaining to a song, it would give rise to a combination of harmonies far more vitally connected with the song's essence, its spiritual significance....²⁷

Farwell simultaneously affirmed the importance of understanding the original context of each song and indicated to what extent he thought this process of understanding could take place solely in the mind of the non-Indian individual. In a rhetorical move similar to the one by which Longfellow replaced Nawadaha with "the land of the Ojibways" as a creative force, Farwell emphasized the sufficiency of what is already in white possession: the melody as fixed in

26. Farwell, "Aspects of Indian Music," 216.

27. Farwell, "Introduction," *Wa-Wan Press* 1, no. 2 (1901); reprinted in volume 1 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 24.

notation. In this light, Farwell's assertions about the advancement of American music gain an unmistakably sinister overtone:

The hunger of art growth in a new country is never appeased until every available source of new art life, and especially folk-expression, has been seized upon and assimilated.... Materialistically, America is sufficiently conquered. We have wrested a living from the soil from East to West, and now we must wrest from it its treasure of poetry.²⁸

Farwell made much of his investment in "The Old Man's Love Song," producing versions for several other performing forces, including solo voice (1908, published 1912) and a *cappella* chorus (1937). Shortly after finishing the piano miniatures of 1901, he crafted a slightly more extended piano piece whose title "Dawn" is taken from the epigraph to "The Old Man's Love Song": "With the dawn I seek thee...." Farwell was quick to emphasize the length of this new work, labelling it as "one result of our labors to prove that we have a distinctive and beautiful folk-song, born of life amidst our own forests, prairies, and mountains, which may form a worthy basis for musical art-works of larger dimensions." He framed this development as a natural, even inevitable step in the evolution of a national music:

In all times and all places great musical art-works have almost invariably been but more highly organized forms developed from the simpler modes of folk-expression.... The purely musical art-works of the great composers of all nations...drew their diverse qualities, their essential elements, in many cases the actual arrangements of the notes of their themes, from the simple songs of the people.²⁹

The fact that Farwell continued this passage with a discussion of Wagner comes as no surprise, considering his

28. Farwell, "Introduction," *Wa-Wan Press* 3, no. 19 (1904); reprinted in volume 2 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 154.

29. Farwell, "Introduction," *Wa-Wan Press* 1, no. 4 (1902); reprinted in volume 1 of *The Wa-Wan Press, 1901-11*, ed. Lawrence, 76.

previous characterization of that composer's embodiment of mythic folk expression. But once one has heard Farwell's "Dawn," the irony of this comparison can be more strongly felt. Although Farwell described it as a fantasy or development on two Indian themes—"The Old Man's Love Song" and an unidentified Otoe melody—this piece presents a strictly sectional structure and a surprisingly rigid preservation of melodic integrity with only occasional changes in accompanimental figuration (example 2). Farwell's striving for simplicity, apparent both in his frequent use of repetitive or ostinato figuration and in the sectional construction

Peacefully. \downarrow 88

The image shows three excerpts of the piano piece "Dawn" by Farwell. Each excerpt consists of a grand staff with a treble and bass clef. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 3/4.

- m. 1:** The right hand features a melodic line with triplet eighth notes, marked with a *8va* and a *3*. The left hand provides a simple accompaniment of chords and single notes. The instruction is *legato and flowing p una corde*.
- m. 32:** The right hand has a more complex melodic line with quintuplet eighth notes, marked with a *8va* and a *5*. The left hand continues with a simple accompaniment. The instruction is *pp una corde*.
- m. 65:** The right hand has a melodic line with triplet eighth notes, marked with a *3*. The left hand features a repetitive ostinato pattern of eighth notes, marked with a *3* and *ped.* (pedal).

Example 2: "Dawn," excerpts [Wa-Wan Press, 1902].

of "Dawn," seems to undermine his grandiose hopes for the future of Indianism. "Dawn" can hardly be considered a "development" in anything approaching a Wagnerian sense. In this particular instance, however, Farwell may have been aware of the incongruity between his rhetoric and his music, for he concluded his introduction with a disclaimed disclaimer: "It is with no desire to forestall criticism that we state plainly our attitude toward this work, which is regarded as an essay, a reaching out into new fields, and therefore, but a partial attainment of what it is hoped to gain eventually.... Only a longer course of such effort can reveal the precise nature of that end for which we are striving."³⁰ That "longer course of effort" fell to Farwell and to a few others, but it is hard to imagine that he would have considered even the works which came after his as a total fulfillment of the end toward which he had been working.

During the period in which Farwell wrote the piano fantasy, he was still the best-known advocate of Indianism in music.³¹ He continued to incorporate American folk materials into some of his works for nearly four decades, though rarely on a larger scale than "Dawn." Numerous piano collections including *From Mesa and Plain* and *Impressions of the Wa-Wan Ceremony of the Omahas* continued to appear in his Press. Two of his shorter pieces brought him some public

30. *Ibid.*, 77.

31. Farwell was eager to preserve this distinction, especially after Cadman's rise to popularity. In a 1935 letter to journalist Quaintance Eaton, he lamented the persistence of certain "misconceptions" about his Indianist works: "Another is that I am some sort of follower of my good friend Charlie Cadman. I had been composing Indian music, playing it and lecturing on it two years at Cornell (1899-1900), and publishing it several years before Cadman began sending me his compositions, and those were not Indian music at all. I advised him to tackle the Indian music or other American folk music sometime about 1902 to 1904. This is what started him on it." Farwell asks that the above material not be published, "unless it should come from Cadman himself." For the complete text of the letter, see Culbertson, *He Heard America Singing*, 108-09.

exposure; American pianist John Kirkpatrick edited Farwell's "Pawnee Horses" and "Navajo War Dance, no. 2" and performed them across the United States during the 1940s. But for the most part, Farwell's compositions afforded him less recognition than his journalistic and organizational activities, which gained him immediate esteem and have assured his current reputation as a progressive figure in the history of American music.³²

...

By contrast, Charles Wakefield Cadman achieved a brief period of extreme public popularity during his lifetime, and—perhaps in consequence—fell into historiographical disrepute shortly thereafter. The fact that his popularity sprang largely from his works on Native American themes was always a source of concern for him (if also a source of income). While more committed to using Indian themes than many of his colleagues—Edward MacDowell or Amy Beach, for example—"Indianist" was not a label that Cadman had chosen. His engagement with Indianism was briefer and started later than Farwell's.³³ It was more practical and less openly ideological. Not interested in organizing a "new art-life for America," he was content—even eager—to take part in established American musical institu-

32. Most of Farwell's Indianist works were written before 1937, after which he turned to more experimental compositional techniques. See, for example, his polytonal piano pieces, op. 109 (1940-52), or his Piano Sonata, op. 113 (1949). Farwell's later works are discussed by Culbertson in *He Heard America Singing*.

33. Harry D. Perison divides Cadman's compositional output into five phases: early works (-1902), first mature works (1902-08), Indianist works (1908-21), dramatic works including film scores, operas, school operettas, and cantatas (1921-35), and late programmatic orchestral works in more complex styles including his "Pennsylvania" Symphony (1939). "Charles Wakefield Cadman: His Life and Works" (Ph.D. diss., University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, 1978).

tions. Partly for this reason, his musical treatment of Native American themes is more complex and, I would argue, more artistically interesting because of the interplay it offers between Euro-American and Indianist materials.

While Farwell had taken full advantage of the musical press to spread his ideas on Americanism, nationalism, and Indianism, Cadman was relatively reticent in this regard. His best known and in this case most relevant article, "The 'Idealization' of Indian Music," appeared in *Musical Quarterly*, under the editorship of Oscar Sonneck during the journal's first year of publication (1915). Striking in Cadman's treatment of the subject is the importance he placed on the aesthetic aims of idealization:

Yet, above all, if the composer has not something to express musically, aside from the thematic material he employs, if he cannot achieve a composition that is aurally pleasing and attractive, it is better that he abstain from the idealization of Indian themes. Music, interesting music and good music first, color afterwards, should be the watchwords for those who experiment with folk-themes.³⁴

Cadman noted further that "only one-fifth of all Indian thematic material is valuable in the hands of a composer—is suitable for harmonic investment." The chosen material must be "attractive in its simplicity," inherently melodic, and "fairly good in symmetry." Once the appropriate material had been selected, Cadman advocated a flexible approach: "The use of folk-themes is but the means and not the end of composition. The potentiality of a folk-theme is in direct ratio to the ability of the composer to idealize it."³⁵

In comparison to his vehement assertions about the priority of artistic quality, Cadman's advice to composers

34. Cadman, "The 'Idealization' of Indian Music," *Musical Quarterly* 1 (1915): 390.

35. *Ibid.*, 391, 395.

about any actual knowledge of Native American life is unimpressive:

One should, if possible, be in touch with the Indian's legends, his stories and the odd characteristics of his music, primitive though they may be, and one should have an insight into the Indian's emotional life concomitant with his naive and charming art-creations. And while not absolutely necessary, a hearing of his songs on the Reservation amidst native surroundings adds something of value to a composer's efforts at idealizing.³⁶

Whether Cadman's characterization of the reservation as an Indian's "native surroundings" indicates a willful self-deception or an awareness of the rapidly changing realities of Native American life, it is clear that he viewed any empathic understanding of Indian experience as merely of secondary importance.

Throughout the article, Cadman projected a curious ambivalence toward his role as a perceived leader of Indianism in American music. On the one hand, he was quite defensive about what he saw as unjust neglect of Americans who endeavored to incorporate folk song into their works. After noting the lack of "any sudden outburst of folk-lore or folk-song that would embody the defeats, the victories, the achievements of our national life," he continued with an extended comparison:

The folk-song that we have attempted to idealize has sprung into existence on the American continent. It is as much the heritage of America and Americans and of the musicians who live in America as the music of the barbaric hordes of Russia is the heritage of cultured Russians and Russian musicians. We could mention several ingenious members of the Russian school of music whose veins are without a drop of blood of those wild tribes and who have, nevertheless, caught and reflected the lilt, the life, and the love of the strange and elemental peoples that make up the great Russian Empire. These gentlemen are respected by their fellow musicians and their object of idealization is considered of some moment. Unfortunately, such a parallel cannot be drawn for America, yet it is evident that our

36. *Ibid.*, 390.

composers have some justification for idealizing the only existent form of folk-song indigenous to American soil.³⁷

If Cadman's comparison seems somewhat less incongruous than Farwell's repeated panegyrics to Wagner as folk-artist, the attempt at legitimization is similar.

Yet Cadman also seems to have wanted to distance himself from the Indianist movement as a whole. In comments that were almost certainly aimed at Farwell, Loomis, Troyer, and the rest of the Wa-Wan contingent, he criticized certain unnamed composers for their lack of originality while praising MacDowell's "Indian" Suite as more than "a mere ethnological report set to music."³⁸ Cadman even tried to minimize the extent to which he took credit for his own article:

The illustrations which follow are entirely due to a request on the part of the Editor of this magazine, and are not meant as a criterion for others to follow. In the course of this article, and only for the purpose of illustrating certain points, it became necessary to inject the personal element.³⁹

37. *Ibid.*, 387-88. Cadman's favorable assessment of Russian musical life continued after the Bolshevik Revolution. Perison states that Cadman was the first American composer to receive a Soviet radio broadcast of his works (in 1935) and that Cadman approved of Soviet "cultural, social, and economic objectives," and "lack of cultural elitism." "Cadman: His Life and Works," 309ff.

38. *Ibid.*, 391. Cadman was anxious to appear independent of Farwell's influence as he reveals in a letter to Alice Fletcher (13 March 1908): "I have never seen or heard much music founded upon Aboriginal themes, save some of Farwell's efforts and MacDowell's Indian Suite, so I am not influenced by any set method or treatment nor have I followed any prescribed scheme. I wanted to be uninfluenced so far as I could." Perison, "Cadman: His Life and Works," 66-68. Most sources state that Cadman had seen issues of the Wa-Wan Press before writing his op. 45; he must also have known those pieces by Farwell that were part of the Indian Music Lecture he gave across the country: "Dawn," "Navajo War Dance," "Pawnee Horses," and selections from the *Impressions of the Wa-Wan Ceremony*. List taken from Arlouine G. Wu's remarkable biography of Cadman's librettist's daughter, *Constance Eberhart: A Musical Career in the Age of Cadman* ([Oxford, MS]: National Opera Association, 1983), 21.

39. Cadman, "The 'Idealization' of Indian Music," 392.

This was more than modesty. It showed Cadman's unwillingness to be seen as a role model for future "Indianists" and suggested, not for the first or last time, the composer's discomfort with the "Indianist" label.

Though Cadman may have been reluctant to serve as an ambassador for Indianism in music, he was in many ways a natural choice after the immense success of his *Four American Indian Songs*, op. 45 written during 1907-08.⁴⁰ Through the influence of his friend and librettist Nelle Richmond Eberhart, Cadman had become interested in Native American materials in 1906, first through Alice Fletcher's works and later through the collections of Theodore Baker (*Über die Musik der nordamerikanischen Wilden*, 1882), Frederick Burton (*American Primitive Music*, 1902), and Natalie Curtis (*The Indians' Book*, 1907). The songs were the first fruits of this involvement, and, together with his "At Dawning" (1906), they brought Cadman a popularity that Farwell never enjoyed. Even in these early works, when Cadman might have been expected to rely on Farwell's established techniques for dealing with Native American melodies, the differences between the two composers' approaches are apparent.

Far from constituting a manifesto for the future of American music, Cadman's songs seem to spring more from exoticism than from nationalism, falling into the same category as his works on Persian, Hindu, or Japanese tunes, the "authenticity" of which is carefully and prominently footnoted in each case.⁴¹ Nevertheless, the *Four American Indian Songs* can tell us something about Cadman's and Eberhart's views of Native Americans and their treatment of folkloric material. The first of the four, "From the Land of

40. Perison, "Cadman: His Life and Works," 42ff. and 416-17.

41. "The Groves of Shiraz," (1911); "I Bind My Hair With Silver (Hindu Song)," (1911); and "Two Little Songs from Japan," (1912).

the Sky-blue Water," was by far the most popular, largely thanks to the prominent American soprano Lillian Nordica, who sang it as an encore all over the country, perhaps in gratitude for Cadman's glowing review of one of her performances in Pittsburgh.⁴² Like Farwell, Cadman utilized melodies collected by Alice Fletcher, in this case from her *Study of Omaha Indian Music* (Cambridge, Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1893). But rather than relying literally on the given melody and words, as Farwell's songs tended to do, "From the Land of the Sky-blue Water" exhibits radical changes to both text and tune, in keeping with Cadman's emphasis on imagination and creativity over loyalty to original sources. According to Eberhart family lore, Nelle's text sprang from a memory and an imagined scenario: "Nelle said she wrote the lyrics to the Omaha melody by imagining a fascinatingly beautiful girl, part Sioux and part French, whom she once saw cross the Niobrara River in a canoe to attend a leap-year dance and whom she imagined to have been taken captive from Minnesota—or 'land of the sky blue water'." Cadman was reported to have employed a similar blend of faithful memory and creative spontaneity in his creation of the music:

Charles had been practicing his organ music for Sunday at the prestigious East Liberty Church when he went into a small room off the big cold church to get rid of some of the numbness in his fingers by the cheerful open fire. As he sat there alone watching the sunlight on the stained-glass window opposite, he suddenly thought of the theme of the love song, and going to the small upright he quickly started the rippling bars of the introduction...after which the harmonies fell in place.⁴³

42. For colorful accounts of Cadman's and Nordica's interactions, see Wu, *Constance Eberhart*, 18 or Grace Overmyer, "Charles Wakefield Cadman," in *Famous American Composers* (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell, 1944), 164-65.

43. Wu, *Constance Eberhart*, 17 cites Lulu Sanford Tefft's *Little Intimate Stories of Charles Wakefield Cadman* (Hollywood: Graham Fischer Corp., 1926), 23. Though he did not seem to care for Tefft's company, Cadman nevertheless endorsed her book.

With Expression ♩104

Con Ped.

Example 3a: "Be Thae-Wa-An (Love Song)," opening phrase
[no. 86 in Fletcher, *Omaha Indian Music* (1893)].

con moto

From the Land of the Sky - blue Wa - ter, They brought a cap - tive maid:

broadly *maestoso*

And her eyes they are lit with light - nings Her heart is not a - fraid!

Example 3b: "From the Land of the Sky-blue Water,"
vocal line only, mm. 5-19 [Boston: White-Smith, 1909].

Whether or not these are entirely accurate accounts of Eberhart's or Cadman's creative process, the emphasis on intuition and personal inspiration serves (as it had for Farwell) as a counterbalance to the fact that the melodies themselves were borrowed and not original.

A comparison of Cadman's score and the Omaha melody reveals no inconsistency with the story of the song's creation (example 3). Apart from the flageolet introduction, the first two lines of the first stanza, and the first line of the second stanza, the tune is flexibly modified and molded into lyrical and periodic phrasing. Most of the other phrases draw not on the corresponding phrases of the original melody, but on the rhythmic profile which Cadman provided for the first phrase of his setting. The piano accompaniment is largely based on a rhythmic ostinato—a "simplifying" trait typical of Indianist pieces by Farwell and others.

The text gently projects the stereotyped image of the defeated hero, or in this case, heroine:

From the Land of the Sky-blue Water,
 They brought a captive maid;
 And her eyes they are lit with lightnings
 Her heart is not afraid!
 But I steal to her lodge at dawning,
 I woo her with my flute;
 She is sick for the Sky-blue Water,
 The captive maid is mute.

As if it were not enough that she be a prisoner, subjected to the wooing of the lover's flute, she is not even granted the ability to speak for herself. Her wildness, flashing through the lightning in her eyes, is simultaneously exciting and unthreatening, safely contained by the complementary images of her captivity and her muteness.

The techniques employed in "From the Land of the Sky-blue Water" are even more striking in the last of the *Four American Indian Songs*, "The Moon Drops Low" (example 4). After a brief introduction, the singer enters with a line that is faithful to the Indian melody for its first phrase, but that quickly becomes freer, relying to a certain extent on motives drawn from the original tune (most notably at the beginning of the second stanza). The piano accompaniment is again a near ostinato, liberally peppered with inverted-

Religioso.
 Double Drumbeat. ♩ 138 Song. ♩. 69

Drum.

Example 4a: "Hae-Thu-Ska Wa-An (Prayer of Warriors)"
 [no. 12 in Fletcher, *Omaha Indian Music* (1893)].

The musical score is written on two staves in G major (one sharp) and 3/8 time. The first staff contains the vocal line with lyrics: "The moon drops low that once soared high As an ea-gle soars in the". The second staff contains the piano accompaniment with the instruction *poco a poco cresc.* and lyrics: "morn ing sky; And the deep dark lies like a death-web spun 'Twi xt the setting moon and the ris - ing sun." The piano part features a descending eighth-note figure.

Example 4b: "The Moon Drops Low," mm. 5-12 [Boston: White-Smith, 1909].

dotted figures and departed from for rhetorical effect. The text is blatant, reinforcing that invidious cultural construction, the living Indian as the last of a dying race:

The moon drops low that once soared high
 As an eagle soars in the morning sky;
 And the deep dark lies like a death-web spun
 'Twi xt the setting moon and the rising sun.
 Our glory sets like the sinking moon;
 The Red Man's race shall be perished soon;
 Our feet shall trip where the web is spun,
 For no dawn shall be ours, and no rising sun.

Not content to let the text alone carry the image of the vanishing race, Cadman has provided an aural equivalent for the process of resignation to defeat. As the second stanza closes, the singer arrives with surprising force on a D[♯] suspended above the C[♯] pedal which will continue until the end of the song (example 5). The power of this moment, however, is immediately eroded. The D quickly capitulates to C[♯], and the piano figuration continues its gradual descent until the singer returns with a final statement of the already repeated text, "no dawn for us and no rising sun." As if exhausted by its previous resistance, the vocal line is here reduced to near-stasis, hovering on the notes of the tonic, C[♯]-minor triad until it is finally reduced to a wordless "Ah—." It can hardly be surprising that, some years later, when Francis La Flesche (son of an Omaha woman and co-author of Fletcher's Omaha research) advised Cadman on Indian musics, he apparently told the composer that this song was

musical score for the first system. The vocal line is in treble clef with a key signature of three sharps (F#, C#, G#) and a common time signature. The lyrics are "No dawn for us, and no rising sun!". The piano accompaniment consists of two staves (treble and bass clefs) with a key signature of three sharps and a common time signature. Dynamics include *ffz* and *ff*. The tempo marking *hurry* is present above the piano part.

musical score for the second system. The vocal line is in treble clef with a key signature of three sharps and a common time signature. The lyrics are "No". The piano accompaniment consists of two staves (treble and bass clefs) with a key signature of three sharps and a common time signature. The tempo marking *molto* is present above the vocal line.

musical score for the third system. The vocal line is in treble clef with a key signature of three sharps and a common time signature. The lyrics are "dawn for us, and no rising sun!". The piano accompaniment consists of two staves (treble and bass clefs) with a key signature of three sharps and a common time signature. Dynamics include *mf* and *pp*. The tempo marking *espressivo* is present above the vocal line.

The vocal part may close *here* * if desired, but the ending as written is more characteristic.

Example 5: "The Moon Drops Low," mm. 29-40.

"not representative of the way an Indian sees himself."⁴⁴ This, after all, had never been the point.

Riding on the success of the *Four American Indian Songs*, Cadman engaged in several projects hoping to capitalize on their popularity. In 1908, he had begun working on an "Indian Music Talk" to take on tour across the country, and after the 1909 publication of op. 45, Cadman intensified his lecturing schedule.⁴⁵ From Boston to San Francisco and from Pittsburgh to London, Cadman presented variations of his lecture-recital. Through his efforts, hundreds of audiences were exposed not only to Native American melodies—which Cadman attempted to explain through comparison with the music of Beethoven, Grieg, Gregorian chant, and a "Mohammedan Call to Prayer"—but also to his own music and works by many of his contemporaries: excerpts from Arthur Nevin's opera *Poia* and MacDowell's "Indian" Suite, Fillmore's harmonization of "The Old

44. Quote taken from Wu, *Constance Eberhart*, 20. No further details are provided.

45. Information on the genesis and content of Cadman's "Indian Music Talk," is taken from Perison, "Cadman: His Life and Works," 75-93, 137-39, and 154-56.

Man's Love Song," and songs or piano pieces by Troyer and Farwell.

The public enthusiasm sparked by these lectures, along with the royalties from the *Four American Indian Songs* and the inevitable flurry of arrangements that they inspired, encouraged Cadman to continue composing as an Indianist. He completed a series of *Idealized Indian Themes* for piano, published in 1912, and, more importantly, began work on a three-act grand opera, initially entitled *Daoma*. The project may have been suggested by La Flesche, who offered to provide the story and to help Cadman collect melodies on the Omaha reservation at Walthill, Nebraska.⁴⁶ The work was to be "purely Indian," meaning that all of its melodic material would either borrow, paraphrase, or imitate Native American songs. It was also to incorporate an elaborate system of orchestrally presented leitmotifs. Cadman and Eberhart collaborated closely from June 1909 until the summer of 1912 when the opera was submitted to the Boston Opera Company who rejected it as "dangerously untheatric."⁴⁷ In an effort to take advantage of the popularity of their famous song, Cadman and Eberhart renamed the opera *The Land of Misty Water*, but it was again rejected, this time by Giorgio Polacco of the Metropolitan Opera House in 1914.⁴⁸

After the failure of *Daoma*, which remains both unperformed and unpublished, Cadman may have been reluctant

46. An added incentive was the announcement in *Musical America* (10 December 1908, 5) of a \$10,000 prize for the "best American opera." The prize eventually went to Horatio Parker's *Fairyland*, set in medieval Europe. Harry D. Perison, "The 'Indian' Operas of Charles Wakefield Cadman," *College Music Symposium* 22, no. 2 (1982): 22ff.

47. Perison cites Cadman's letter to Eberhart (1 March 1917) relating his 1912 encounter with Henry Russell of the Boston Opera Company, "Cadman: His Life and Works," 134.

48. Perison, "'Indian' Operas," 24. The opera was continually revised throughout Cadman's lifetime and was eventually retitled *Ramala*.

to try another opera on an Indian theme. His next attempt, at any rate, was much less risky, requiring only five principal singers and a chorus—a practical, one-act opera written with Eberhart in about four months. Though conceived as a minor work, suitable for community groups—and perhaps, if successful, as a stepping-stone toward a performance of *Daoma*—this modest opera, *Shanewis* (*The Robin Woman*), became the composer's next big success.⁴⁹ Its prestigious premiere at the Metropolitan on 23 March 1918 was a direct result of the wartime cancellation of all operas by German composers for the 1917-18 season.⁵⁰ It was the first American opera produced by the Metropolitan to remain in the repertory (if only for one additional year), the first with a female librettist, and the first with a contemporary American setting.⁵¹ Curiously, this contemporary setting was one of the reasons Cadman gave for labeling *Shanewis* not an "Indian Opera" but an "American" one—an attempt both to distance himself from Indianism and to make a name for himself as one of America's leading operatic composers:

The composer does not call this an Indian opera. In the first place, the story and libretto bear upon a phase of present-day American life with the Indian in transition. As it is not a mythological tale nor yet an aboriginal story, and since more than three-fourths of the actual composition of the work lies within the boundaries of original cre-

49. *Shanewis* was performed at the Metropolitan in 1918 on 23, 28 March, and 5, 10, 15 April; it was heard three times in 1919 (12, 30 March, 4 April). Additional performances took place in Chicago (9 November 1922 and 5 April 1923), in Denver (5 December 1924), and in Los Angeles (24 June 1926).

50. *Shanewis* was co-billed with two other ethnically charged works: a ballet set to Henry Gilbert's symphonic poem *Dance in Place Congo*, which utilized black American folk material, and Franco Leoni's *L'Oracolo*, an opera set in San Francisco's Chinatown. See Irving Kolodin's *The Metropolitan Opera, 1883-1966* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1966), 258ff., 273ff., or Quaintance Eaton, *The Miracle of the Met* (New York: Meredith Press, 1968), 193ff.

51. Perison, "Indian Operas," 48.

ative effort (that is: not built upon native tunes in any way) there is no reason why this work should be labelled an Indian opera. Let it be an opera upon an American subject or if you will—an American opera!⁵²

The desire to frame *Shanewis* as more than a product of Indianism is also apparent in Cadman's and Eberhart's suggestion that opera companies choose costumes representing "the various phases of America in the Making." Among the specific options offered are Queen Isabella of Spain, Evangeline (presumably Longfellow's), John Alden, and Pocohantas for the four leads, and a chorus including Sir Francis Drake, Leif Ericsson, John Paul Jones, Abraham Lincoln, Ralph Waldo Emerson, Susan B. Anthony, Martha Washington, Betsy Ross, Salem Witches, Quakers, Franciscan Monks, and Rip van Winkle!⁵³ Clearly the authors wished to transcend the apparent limitations of a historically or ethnographically "correct" stage presentation. In his idealization of Indian scenes, as in his idealization of Indian themes, Cadman valued aesthetic effect more than accuracy in representation.

At least some of the inspiration for *Shanewis* came from the model for its title character, Cadman's friend and associate Tsianina Redfeather, the Cherokee-Creek soprano who assisted him for years in his Indian Music Lecture.⁵⁴ (*Shanewis* is an approximate transliteration of her name.) Cadman was careful, however, to point out the crucial difference between the real Tsianina and the fictional

52. Foreword to *The Robin Woman (Shanewis): An American Opera* (Boston: White-Smith Music Publishing, 1918), 3.

53. "Argument" of *The Robin Woman (Shanewis)*, 4-5.

54. While Lulu Sanford Tefft credits Tsianina with suggesting the opera's subject, Perison argues that the suggestion had come from several of the composer's friends in Denver, including John C. Wilcox. Noted in Gary William Mayhood, "Charles Wakefield Cadman and His Opera *Shanewis*" (M.Mus., Kansas State University, 1991), 62-63. For more information on Tsianina, see her autobiographical *Where Trails Have Led Me* (Burbank, CA: T. Blackstone, 1968).

Shanewis. In fact, in a letter to Eberhart, Cadman strongly cautioned against overvaluing fidelity to Tsianina's actual, relatively non-violent biography:

I had hoped that you would carry out the tragic ending, with the Indian girl either killing herself or being killed or else stabbing the false lover in a passion or frenzy at the revelation of his perfidy. That would give an opportunity for BIG MUSIC and dramatic music. I fear you are thinking too much of Tsianina's own characteristics and *her* life and story of her career rather than the *manufacturer* of a plot that will be grand operish!

And in the same letter:

Tsianina said you felt the tragic ending or the killing or being killed business was not "Indian" or "civilised Indian" for this age and day and therefore you felt we could be TRUER in our conception by not doing it. That may be ethnologically true and may be consonant with Tsianina's *own character* but I have never at any time associated this plot of hers with *her life story* save ONLY the opening which is that drawing room scene and the fact of her having a "benefactress." Outside these two TRUE events I had pictured the whole plot in the nature of a tragedy or melodrama such as one thinks of and associates with the grand opera stage.⁵⁵

Though linked to Tsianina by her professional training and white patroness (Mrs. Everton), Shanewis becomes one member of a predictably ill-fated love triangle. In the opera's first part, Shanewis sings for Mrs. Everton's guests and inspires Lionel (the fiancé of Mrs. Everton's daughter Amy) to fall hopelessly in love with her. Lionel and Shanewis escape to the pow-wow scene of the opera's second part. Amy and Mrs. Everton follow close behind, arriving in time to precipitate the tragic denouement. When Shanewis learns of Lionel's engagement to Amy, she renounces him and prepares to lead a life of solitude in the forest. But as soon as Lionel is convinced to return to Amy,

55. Letter from Cadman to Eberhart, 1 March 1917. Cited in Perison, "'Indian' Operas," 37-38.

Shanewis's brother kills him with a mysterious poison arrow.

The dramatic death scene as climax is an operatic commonplace independent of Indianism, but not all of Cadman's choices for *Shanewis* can hide behind the shield of conventionality to the same degree. One might have expected Cadman's long-term, friendly, and extremely productive association with Native Americans like Tsianina and La Flesche to have made him sensitive to the cultural clichés which Indianism tended to enforce, and indeed some aspects of the opera, including its contemporary setting, support this claim. I will examine the interplay between aesthetic and socio-cultural considerations in three passages from the opera—Shanewis's entrance and songs, the pow-wow scene that opens the second part, and Shanewis's monologue denouncing the white race as the opera ends.

Though Cadman may have employed as many as twenty "genuine Red Indian themes" in the opera,⁵⁶ his use of this material is most apparent in set pieces presented to an onstage audience, the first two of which form the heroine's opening scena. Much can be made of her initial appearance. The audience at the Metropolitan in 1918, assembled for the performance of *Shanewis* (the opera), would have found itself immediately mirrored on stage by the audience at Mrs. Everton's soirée, eagerly awaiting the debut recital of Shanewis (the character).⁵⁷ Because the opera is entirely

56. Cadman, "Some Confessions about *Shanewis*," *Violinist* (July 1918): 354, cited in Mayhood, "Charles Wakefield Cadman," 95.

57. This situation is further complicated by the fact that Tsianina apparently confused some members of the Metropolitan audience when she appeared in the lobby in "Indian costume." Review in *The Evening World*, cited in *Musical Courier* 76 (4 April 1918): 13. Though the title role was initially played by Sophie Braslau (on short notice after the illness of Alice Gentle), Tsianina did eventually play Shanewis in two performances at the Hollywood Bowl on 24 and 28 June 1926. Perison, "Cadman: His Life and Works," 233ff.

[A long music room.... A group of young people stroll about, chatting expectantly.]

CHORUS OF YOUNG MEN AND DEBUTANTES: Shanewis, the Indian maiden, will sing this evening; Her first appearance as cantrice; At least 'twill have the charm of novelty!

DEBUTANTES: I wonder what her gown is, of buckskin or of silk? She wears a beaded costume of Alaskan caribou.

YOUNG MEN: The costume does not matter, Is she beautiful?

ALL: And can she sing? Oh, I wonder, I wonder, can she sing?

MRS. EVERTON: One word before I bring Shanewis, that you may hear her with kindness. Remember she is no alien nightingale fostered by tender, sea-born zephyrs in balmy climes where the charmed air exhales a golden melody. She is a native forest bird born of our mighty wilderness, warmed by our fervent sun, taught by our free winds and leaping canyon waters a strange primeval song of ancient intervals.

AMY: I am curious to hear Shanewis; I've scarcely seen her. She only came this morning and has spent the day in quiet.

LIONEL: Where did your mother find her?

AMY: In Oklahoma, while I was abroad. She is a descendant of the great Tecumseh. Is she not lovely?

[Amy takes framed photograph of Shanewis...and hands it to him.]

LIONEL: Beautiful! So straight, so tall, so lithe and slender! Years ago, in Arizona, I saw a face like hers, with the same proud eyes, the same white, flashing smile....

[Mrs. Everton re-enters right followed by Shanewis and accompanist. Shanewis is in white caribou, beaded. The pianist seats herself at piano; Shanewis stands in the curve; Amy and Lionel sit near piano.]

CHORUS: Hush! Hush!...

Example 6a: *Shanewis*, opening scene [Boston: White-Smith, 1918].

without subplots, conversation must focus on the imminent arrival of Mrs. Everton's curious protégé (example 6). The preparation for her arrival on stage is threefold. First the chorus of spectators, then Mrs. Everton, then the still-betrothed couple Lionel and Amy comment on the strangeness of the occasion. As the chorus's call for quiet verbally signals Shanewis's physical presence, the music gives the signal as well. An unusual interpolation of chromatically descending triads in the chorus—each paired in the orchestra with the triad a tritone apart—marks the exotic arrival. Shanewis, in beaded costume, enters onto a staged

The musical score for Example 6b consists of three staves. The top staff is a vocal line with four measures, each containing the word "Hush!". The middle staff is a piano accompaniment marked *pp* (pianissimo), featuring a melodic line with eighth and sixteenth notes. The bottom staff shows a harmonic accompaniment with chords, including some with open fifths. The key signature has three sharps (F#, C#, G#) and the time signature is 2/4.

Example 6b: *Shanewis*, reaction to title character's entrance, reduced.

stage, twice framed as the "native forest bird" with her "strange primeval song of ancient intervals."

When *Shanewis* begins her aria, the "Spring Song of the Robin Woman," the orchestra falls silent, and she is accompanied only by a pianist visible on stage. The opening of her melody is taken from a Cheyenne Swinging Song, collected by Natalie Curtis (example 7). Predictably enough, the tune is altered to provide periodic phrasing and conventional melodic goals. But *Shanewis*'s difference does not melt away as Cadman idealizes her melody. Instead it is accentuated by the pianist's persistent hammering of open fifths and eventually of parallel chords over a drone pedal. The marked music of *Shanewis*'s entrance and aria do not inevitably accompany her presence on stage. In fact, in the *Ojibway Canoe Song* that serves as encore to the "Spring Song" and completes the scena, Cadman drops the drum-

With swinging rhythm
not too fast mm. ♩ 78

The musical score for Example 7a is a single melodic line in 2/4 time. It features a swinging rhythm and includes triplets. The lyrics are written below the notes, alternating between English and Ojibwe. The key signature has three sharps (F#, C#, G#).

Huch-dje - ho _____ ni - och-dzi! Huch-dje - ho _____ ni-och dzi! Ma - ta - e - ta -
 Come, ye wood rats, here to me! come, ye wood rats, here to me! Now the tim-ber -
 ni - o - o I - ni sto - ni - wah - no - tzi - yo E - he - no - we, h'm - h'm - h'm
 men draw near Hith-er steal - ing, creep - ing hither Now I hear them, h'm - h'm - h'm

Example 7a: "Wawahi No-Otz (Swinging Song),"
[Curtis, *The Indians' Book* (1907)].

Allegretto giocoso ♩ 116 (Like an incantation)

mp Oh, ye ___ birds of spring,

mf (woodwind)

mf *simile* *mp*

Come from your hid - ing: Rob-ins all and humming birds, Come un - to this barren land.

poco *a* *poco* *animato*

Hear the wa - ters glid ing

Example 7b: Shanewis, "Spring Song of the Robin Woman," mm. 1-16.

bass for a more conventional, waltz-like accompaniment (though the meter remains slightly irregular, alternating 6/8 and 9/8 bars). The absence of Indianist references in the later love scene between Shanewis and Lionel is another indication that Cadman turns to Indianism only when its colors are convenient. In this case, Indianism serves the dramatic function of molding our initial impressions of the title character as exotic.

The manipulation of Indianist material is equally apparent in the opening of the opera's second part, at the pow-wow to which Shanewis brings Lionel: a colorful crowd scene, complete with ice-cream and balloon vendors, a chorus of high-school girls, and even a jazz band.⁵⁸ Cadman's pow-wow, with its portrayal of the multiple layers of American society, was much commented upon. The critic for *Musical Courier* not only delighted in the novelty of the tableau, but also betrayed an alarming willingness to take it as an accurate representation of Native American culture: "The second scene, a summer powpow [*sic*] in Oklahoma, was undoubtedly true to life, with its tepees, its dilapidated Ford in the background, and the lemonade and peanut stands with their tawdry red, white, and blue bunting.... The first act was played in modern evening costume. The Indian costumes of the second act...were quaint and attractive."⁵⁹

Cadman's stage directions call for "full-blood Indians and half-breeds in ceremonial, mongrel or modern dress and white spectators in holiday attire." Each group has its own music and text, so meticulously differentiated that the "half-bloods" selling lemonade are explicitly separated from the chorus of "Indians" (example 8). The pow-wow is

58. Most sources note this as the first appearance of a jazz band on the operatic stage.

59. *Musical Courier* (28 March 1918): 8.

[Approaching sunset. The closing scenes of a modern summer encampment or pow-wow of an Oklahoma tribe of Indians are in progress....]

INDIANS: The Sun walks in the south whence come all light and brightness; but now he goes to the west where dwells the end of all. So we forsake our ceremonies, so we cease from singing.

TOY-BALLOON VENDORS (BOYS): Balloons, balloons, just like the American flag! Red, white and blue balloons!

LEMONADE VENDORS (HALF-BLOODS): Lemonade! Ice-cold lemonade, very refreshing in the heat.

SPECTATORS: See the handsome man with the pretty Indian maid; I wonder is it a flirtation? The crops are looking fine, but we need more rain, we need more rain. This wind is destructive; the soil is dry! 'Tis growing late!

JAZZ-BAND OF EIGHT YOUNG PEOPLE: Za za za za...

ICE-CREAM CONE VENDORS: Ice-cream cones!...

INDIANS: The drums grow silent, the dance is over!

SPECTATORS: The sun is sinking fast!

.....

SPECTATORS: Pow-wows are picturesque and quite unique; This has been a splendid show, a gala week. But now the end has come.

INDIANS: Yo ho ho ho Hi yo ho hi yo ho...

Example 8a: *Shanewis*, opening of Part 2.

Shan. *mf cresc.*
Ah..... Love!

Lionel *cresc.*
nest up-on my tree of lovè And fill my life with mel-o-dy, with

Bal. Ven. *f cresc.*
Balloons! Balloons! Bal-loons!

Lem. Ven. *f cresc.*
Lem-on-ade! Lem-on-ade! Iced lem-on-ade

Spectators *mf cresc.*
Pow-wows are pic-turesque and quite u-nique: This has been a

Example 8b: *Shanewis*, layered texture of vocal parts during pow-wow scene.

a multi-ethnic event, but the picture Cadman provides of this event is one in which different social groups are strictly segregated, reinforcing one of the possible morals of the opera's plot: the inevitable doom of interracial mixing.⁶⁰

As in Mrs. Everton's drawing room, the spectators at the pow-wow are prominent (and white). They watch and offer comments—"Pow-wows are picturesque and quite unique; This has been a splendid show, a gala week"—again inviting the audience watching the opera to identify with the voyeurism of the on-stage spectators. As these spectators leave, Lionel starts to follow them. Shanewis stops him, crying out, "No, there's one more song!"—in effect, announcing the arrival of the opera's most "authentically Indian" moment just as her own appearance was announced by Mrs. Everton and company (example 9). The footnote in the score says it all: "This is an Osage Indian ceremonial song and is used by permission of the U.S. Bureau of American Ethnology." The song, carefully separated from the preceding melange of activity, is un-idealized, sung in its original vocables, and accompanied only by gourd rattles, timpani, and lower strings. Such an approach, apparently contradicting Cadman's usual "idealizing" aims, was evidently not so unusual in his music for works depicting Native Americans on stage. In the Foreword to his piano arrangement of incidental music for the play *Thunderbird*, by Norman Bel Geddes, Cadman notes the following:

It may interest my readers to know that in the play "Thunderbird" I used the above Blackfeet Indian tunes in their native state, without altering a single note.... All my "idealizing" such as you find in this piano score was indulged in at the fall of the curtain or between the

60. Compare Amy's later address to the faithless Lionel: "(earnestly) I plead for you and for our unity of blood. Each race is noble when the line is clear, but mingled bloods defile each other; it is the law."

91
 * [Four old Indians range themselves in center of stage.]

Rattles $\frac{2}{4}$

TENORS and BARITONE in falsetto

Four old Indians

Tsi-go he - tho^a-be sho^a ni wa ta

(Tympani and lower strings)

wa-ko^a he tse he, Tsi-go he she sho^a ni wa ta wa-ko^a he tse he,

Ba-bhi he - tho^a-be sho^a ni wa ta wa-ko^a he tse he, Tsi-go he -

92

tho^a-be sho^a ni wa ta Tsi-go he - tho^a-be sho^a ni wa ta

Clav. & pizz. Str.

* Note: This is an Osage Indian ceremonial song and is used by permission of the U.S. Bureau of American Ethnology

Example 9: Shanewis, Song of the Four Old Indians, opening.

acts. In this way the audience hears the tunes in "native form" and later with the "white man's harmonies."⁶¹

Cadman implies that the process of idealization can be separated from the process of representation, but his distinction holds true only to a certain small degree. It could be argued that Cadman's representation aims to emphasize the foreignness of that which is represented (the Osage ceremonial song, or the Blackfoot tunes in "native form"), while his idealization aims to assimilate (the "Spring Song of the Robin Woman," or Shanewis herself). But in reality, the processes by which these two effects are achieved are startlingly similar, especially in their use of framing devices. As the curtain falls on the ostensible process of stage representation, the "white man's harmonies" merely replace the white man's gaze.

The opera's most complicated confluence of dramatic, musical, and cultural concerns can be found near the end of its second part, as Shanewis delivers a remarkably passionate denunciation of white men's dealings with Native Americans:

For half a thousand years
 Your race has cheated mine
 With sweet words and noble sentiments,
 Offering friendship, knowledge, protection.
 With one hand you gave niggardly,
 With the other took away greedily!
 The lovely hunting grounds of my fathers
 You have made your own;
 The bison and the elk have disappeared before you,
 The giants of the forest are no more.
 Your ships infest our rivers,
 Your cities mar our hills.
 What gave you in return?
 A little learning, restless ambition,
 A little fire-water,
 And many, many cruel lessons in treachery!

61. Cadman, Foreword to the Piano Suite, "Thunderbird" (Boston: White-Smith Publishing Company, 1917), 3.

Cadman's setting of Eberhart's text is one of the opera's most successful exercises in integration (example 10). At the very moment when Shanewis's words most call attention to antagonism between races, her music performs the opposite task, mixing Indianist and Euro-American elements with unusual freedom.

Like the other passages I have discussed, this one is a framed event, though its frame is of a different sort. After Lionel interrupts Shanewis's recitative, she counters, "Be silent! Let me speak." This textual preface is coupled with a musical one in which a descending melodic sequence leads to V of B minor, complete with *rallentando* and vocal cadence (5-1). This is a "western" frame and not an exotic one, a trope rooted in Italian operatic traditions. In its advertised roles as traditional dramatic climax and operatic set piece, the monologue's aesthetic function offsets some of its political implications. As Shanewis offers the most racially

The musical score for Example 10a consists of two systems. The first system features a vocal line with the lyrics "Be si - lent! Let me speak..." and a piano accompaniment. The piano part includes a triplet of eighth notes in the right hand and a descending bass line in the left hand. The second system begins with the tempo marking "mp Andante amarissimamente" and the lyrics "For half a thou-sandyears Your race has cheated mine With sweet words and noble sen - timents." The piano accompaniment in the second system includes a "poco rall." marking and a melodic line in the right hand.

Example 10a: Shanewis, title character's monologue, opening.

f
Your ships in - fest our riv - ers, Your cit - ies mar - our

mf

poco più 3
hills. What gave you in re - turn?

poco più

più lento
A lit - the learn - ing, rest - less am - bi - tion, A lit - the fire wa - ter, And

pp

a tempo 3 6 6
ma - ny, ma - ny cru - el les - sons in treach - er - y!

a tempo 3 6 6

Example 10b: *Shanewis*, title character's monologue, closing.

charged statements of the opera, she simultaneously steps into the role of the outraged heroine; this robs her words of some of their specific impact. At the moment when Shanewis might be most powerfully associated with a Native American voice, she is also linked to operatic heroines of other nations: Lakmé, Aida, and perhaps Carmen.

A similar sort of balancing can be found between the melodic and harmonic styles of Shanewis's arioso. Its hexatonic melodic fragments and inverted-dotted figures are clothed in harmonies that are pure Puccini. Like a mirror image of the Caucasian singer Sophie Braslau who sang the title role in elaborate buckskin costume, Shanewis's monologue presents its "exotic" elements in distinctly Italianate garb. This aspect of Cadman's harmonic language was not lost on his contemporaries; a reviewer for *Musical Courier* described Shanewis's love duet in terms that could also be applied to the monologue: "While there is absolutely no reason for charging Mr. Cadman with plagiarism, it is evident that he realizes that Puccini is the most effective writer for the musical stage today, and has accordingly taken the Italian for a model." The *Evening Sun*, commenting both on the opera's harmonic idiom and (though only obliquely) on its racially charged setting, even called *Shanewis* an "American *Madama Butterfly*."⁶²

Cadman gave Shanewis's monologue special attention, though it is impossible to say whether he was inspired by sympathy for the heroine and her people or by the general dramatic potential of the scene. The monologue offers a

62. *Musical Courier* (28 March 1918): 8. The review from the *Evening Sun* is reprinted in *Musical Courier* (4 April 1918): 13. I have encountered no documentary evidence that Cadman heard either *Madame Butterfly* or *The Girl of the Golden West*. However, he was sufficiently impressed by *Tosca* in 1909 to write: "The joy of seeing it and the object lesson in operatic construction and color was incalculable to me. I got many points." Perison, "Cadman: His Life and Works," 102-03.

richness of semiotic interplay unequalled elsewhere in the work. More than any other point in the opera, it takes advantage of Shanewis as a fascinating site of contradiction. Musicologist Harry Perison notes as much when he refers to the monologue as the opera's "musical high point," and "an effective vehicle for this, the most serious and dignified passage in the entire libretto."⁶³ Surprisingly, however, Shanewis's monologue does not seem to have inspired much comment among Cadman's contemporaries. Most reviewers did not mention it at all; the critic for *Musical Courier* described it simply as "effective."⁶⁴

The apparent willingness of critics to overlook the politically charged monologue text and its musically complex setting reflects a more general critical indifference to any of the social or cultural information encoded in Cadman's most successful opera. Of the reviews that I have seen, only one recognized political implications in *Shanewis*, and even this one suggested that any apparent tensions between whites and Indians were part of the past and not the present:

What yesterday's audience first heard was Mr. Cadman's overture in sharp contrast with much that was to follow: a tragic overture to a merry scene, as surely as his opera's later intermezzo was light and gay by way of prelude to a swift sombre culmination. The double contrast was intentional, it was clever, and it worked like yeast in the dough. Under the sparkling froth of a society in which moved and sang an Indian girl of today, there could be felt the dark current of past dealings with the Red Man.⁶⁵

As the reviewer noted, Cadman's juxtaposition of a "tragic overture" with a "merry scene" or a "light" intermezzo with a "sombre" conclusion has a certain aesthetic appeal. But the implied dissociation of the "Indian girl of today"

63. Perison, "Indian Operas," 46.

64. *Musical Courier* (28 March 1918): 8.

65. *New York Times* review, reprinted in *Musical Courier* (4 April 1918): 13.

from the "dark current of past dealings with the Red Man" raises uncomfortable questions. The character Shanewis already indicates in her monologue that she does not recognize such a separation; she sees Lionel's betrayal as part of a historical series of dishonest actions by whites. But if the separation between present and past events is problematic for Shanewis, how much more so for Tsianina Redfeather, whom Cadman dissociates so easily from her biography in order to achieve effects that will be "grand operish"? The problem, again, is one of representation and reception. Cadman's process of idealization invites a separation between "text" and "context"; it focuses on the properties of a melody while ignoring its original uses; it turns Tsianina into Shanewis. In his preface to the opera, Cadman eschewed the label "Indian" in part because of the libretto's contemporary setting: "it is not a mythological tale nor yet an aboriginal story." Cadman continually reminds us that he is interested in musical or dramatic effectiveness and not ethnography. But like Longfellow, whose narratives "millions mistook for history," Cadman was participating in a profitable tradition of racial representation that still shapes American cultural assumptions.

Cadman continued to capitalize on his reputation as Indianist for a few years after his success at the Metropolitan. While Shanewis lingered in the public memory through excerpted arrangements and so-called Operalogues for local music clubs,⁶⁶ Cadman composed one of his last Indianist works, a piece whose title reads in full: *The Sunset Trail: An Operatic Cantata Depicting the Struggles of the American Indians Against the Edict of the United States Government Restricting Them to Prescribed Reservations*.⁶⁷ Like *Shanewis*, this

66. See Wu, *Constance Eberhart*, 44ff. for descriptions of some of these events.

67. *The Sunset Trail* was first performed in San Diego on 23 August 1920; other performances took place in Denver (5 December 1922), Rochester (under Howard Hanson) in November of 1926, and Los Angeles in 1926.

cantata represents a remarkable mixture of cultural awareness, dramatic convention, and racial stereotype. It was one of Cadman's few Indianist works independent of Eberhart,⁶⁸ and its characters are relatively flat—much less developed than those of his operas. Thus, the cantata's music must make up the difference.

The melodies Cadman borrows in this work are not advertised as Indian.⁶⁹ The characters are all Native Americans; no white spectators guide the audience's reactions to the scene. Instead, Cadman's score artfully manipulates our perception of the Indian characters through a progression of musical topics ranging from relatively unmarked music (typically diatonic and functionally harmonic) to music which boasts the hallmarks of Indianism (typically pentatonic with disjunct or static harmonies). This is particularly apparent in the opening scene, where hammered rhythms and quasi-pentatonicism mark the choral invocation: "Great Spirit, O Great Spirit. . . Thy people take / The sunset trail of destiny, / Who once possessed / The fair rich valleys of the dawn." This gives way to an *a cappella* rendering of pleasant memories—an unthreatening text set in barbershop harmonies, which is in turn rudely interrupted by an affirmation in stark unison, pentatonic fragments: "But still unconquered, free, / Still unafraid they face / Sunset and destiny." Cadman consistently associated his most marked music with texts foreshadowing the Indians' defeat and submission to "destiny."

The same process operates in condensed form at the close of the piece (example 11). After a sixteen-measure, off-stage battle between the Indians and the whites, the tenor

68. The librettist was Gilbert Moyle. Apparently Cadman gave all rights to future royalties to the librettist's family after Moyle's sudden death in 1925. See Wu, *Constance Eberhart*, 82.

69. Perison indicates that the work does use Native American melodies but does not specify these. "Cadman: His Life and Works," 232.

REDFEATHER AND WILDFLOWER

Togeth- er build our lodge of love, our lodge of love

rall.-----

4

3rd-----

rall.-----

(8va)-----

pp

OLD MAN

We have heed - ed — a false pro - phet!

f

mf con moto

(REDFEATHER dies)

ff dramatico

8^{va}---

CHIEF

Thus are we pun - ished!

(8va)

3

3

3

Example 11a: *The Sunset Trail*, final scene [Boston: White-Smith, (1925)].

CHORUS

f Tempo Primo

The musical score consists of four systems. The first system shows the vocal line and piano accompaniment in G major, marked *f* and *Tempo Primo*. The lyrics are: "Great Spir - it, O Great Spir - it, Thou hast willed! Great". The second system continues the vocal line and piano accompaniment, with lyrics: "Spir - it, O Great Spir - it. Great Spir - it, O Great Spir - it. Ah!". The piano accompaniment features a steady eighth-note bass line and a more active treble line. The third system shows a sustained chord in the piano, with a fermata over the notes. The fourth system features a piano solo with a driving eighth-note bass line and a treble line with octaves and triplets, marked *ff* and *fff*.

Great Spir - it, O Great Spir - it, Thou hast willed! Great

Spir - it, O Great Spir - it. Great Spir - it, O Great Spir - it. Ah!

ff *fff*

Example 11b: *The Sunset Trail*, closing, reduced [Boston: White-Smith, (1925)].

Redfeather staggers mortally wounded onto the stage and, with his lover Wildflower, briefly recalls music from their earlier love duet—operatic music at its least exotic. But in the passages that follow, Cadman gradually moves first to unfamiliar harmonic ground as the Old Man exclaims, “We have heeded a false prophet!” and eventually to stasis as the chief states, “Thus are we punished!” An interlude of open

fifths prepares for a reprise of music from the cantata's opening: the Chief's arioso and the choral outburst in stacked, pentatonic lines, "Great Spirit, O Great Spirit, Thou hast willed!" Again, the final "Ah!"—with its move from dissonance to consonance and the registral drop of its soprano line—only affirms the Indians' utter defeat and only lasts long enough to postpone the move from the complete F-major triad sounded in the first half of the measure to the characteristic open fifths which close the piece. In the space of some fifty bars, Cadman provides enough unmarked music for a convincing love-duet, and enough exoticism that the final defeat of the Indians, at the hands of an invisible white army, can be accomplished with minimal moral qualms.

• • •

Cadman shows a special fondness for sunset imagery—clearly in the cantata but also in the pow-wow scene of *Shanewis*.⁷⁰ It is not an innocent choice. Doubly figurative—as metonym for the West and metaphor for death—sunset could symbolize everything that turn-of-the-century America wanted to think about the vanishing Indian. As a naturally occurring phenomenon, sunset carries with it an aura of inevitability; as long as its golden rays color the forced migrations of Indian tribes, white guilt can be assuaged if not eclipsed. It is no accident that Longfellow relied on a similar trope in relating "Hiawatha's Departure" after the arrival of missionaries "from the land of light and morning":

70. Text passages include the Indians' phrases, "The Sun walks in the south / Whence come all light and brightness / But now he goes to the west / Where dwells the end of all." See example 8a.

And the evening sun descending
 Set the clouds on fire with redness,
 Burned the broad sky, like a prairie,
 Left upon the level water
 One long track and trail of splendor,
 Down whose stream, as down a river,
 Westward, westward Hiawatha
 Sailed into the fiery sunset,
 Sailed into the purple vapors,
 Sailed into the dusk of evening.
 And the people from the margin
 Watched him floating, rising, sinking,

 Sinking in the purple distance.
 And they said, "Farewell forever!"
 Said, "Farewell, O Hiawatha!"

 Thus departed Hiawatha
 Hiawatha the beloved,
 In the glory of the sunset.⁷¹

Even today, sunset is probably the most persistent visual image in non-Native depictions of Native Americans, and even today, the image carries with it the uncanny implications of a eulogy for the living and the insidious promise of a self-fulfilling prophecy.

Though a potent symbol, the "glory of the sunset" is not the only glory that American artists have sought to associate with works on Native American themes. Recall Farwell's piano fantasy "Dawn" and his rhetoric of rebirth and national awakening. The absorption of Native American influences that Farwell saw as inevitable was to be a key factor in the creation of a "new art-life for America," a profoundly revitalizing force, and a sign of the dawning, so to speak, of a New Age—a conception that still resonates in many cultural arenas nearly one hundred years after Farwell's writings.

71. *The Poetical Works of Henry Wadsworth Longfellow* (Boston: Houghton, Mifflin, and Company, 1887), 151-52.

It is not surprising that references to these two apparent opposites—dawn and sunset—should be found in such proximity or that they should be associated with white views of Native Americans, in particular with the themes of the defeated warrior and the dying race. As Brian Dippie notes in his study, *The Vanishing American: White Attitudes and U.S. Indian Policy*, “The Vanishing American, in short, represented a perfect fusion of the nostalgic with the progressive impulse.”⁷² It is easy to find nostalgia in Cadman’s compositional aesthetic and “the progressive impulse” in Farwell’s idealism. Indeed, these two adjectives—“nostalgic” and “progressive”—could serve as convenient designators of the historiographical categories in which Cadman and Farwell are most often placed. This is one of the factors which has discouraged comparison of their approaches and has concealed similarities in their underlying assumptions. But just how different are the “nostalgic” and “progressive” impulses, and how artificial is the opposition between sunset and dawn?

Dawn and sunset share the connotations of a gradual evolution (whether of race, nation, or art) independent of human agency, a theme with special significance for Farwell, Cadman, and their contemporaries, especially in relation to the development of “American” music. Olin Downes, for example, was only restating a typical view when he wrote:

I conceive that there are three principal periods in the development of a national music culture. First, the period which is necessarily one of imitation of well-developed foreign models; second, the revolt against imitation, and the equally necessary cultivation of folk-melody...third, the time when the spiritual consciousness of the people and the musical idioms transmuted...from the original folk-

72. Brian W. Dippie, *The Vanishing American: White Attitudes and U.S. Indian Policy* (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1982), xii.

songs, rather than the original material, are responsible for the highly specialized expression of a leading composer.⁷³

Farwell and Cadman firmly subscribed to this view of musical evolution, partly as a defensive measure. In describing "Dawn," Farwell called it "an essay, a reaching out into new fields, and therefore but a partial attainment of what it is hoped to gain eventually." Cadman, too, framed his Indianist works as a step toward musical Americanism: "the beginnings of an American school of music must tie to a tangible something, and the trail-blazers have utilized the means at hand for their first 'infant' expression of a music expressing the land which they call home."⁷⁴

What is unusual about Farwell's and Cadman's reliance on Downes's hackneyed Hegelian model is the place they seem to claim for themselves within its three stages. Instead of putting them in alliance with the third term of the dialectic development—with the triumphant synthesis of the universal and the particular (the imported and the indigenous)—their rhetoric ties them to the second term, the antithesis. In a strategy which is both modest and risky, Farwell and Cadman seem to unite the imported paradigm of artistic evolution with the American cultural icon of the trail-blazing pioneer. Instead of fully exploiting the self-sufficiency suggested by the pioneering model or the valedictory power of the model of artistic evolution, they let the two models exist uneasily side by side, just as the Native American melodies in their works often sit uneasily in their Euro-American contexts.

In different ways, Farwell and Cadman invite us to view their activities as innocent or even naive, to regard composers of Indianist music as nostalgic dreamers, idealistic

73. Olin Downes, "An American Composer," *Musical Quarterly* 4 (1918): 35-36.

74. Cadman, "'Idealization'," 395.

crusaders, or musical pioneers. But there is guilt as well as innocence encoded in these formulations, for nothing can be simple in a national art which is necessarily exotic.