

## Appendix Materials

### 1. Main Result Robustness Table

This table shows estimates of the McCarthy intervention effect based on the model in Table 2, Column 5. Across a variety of robustness checks, it shows that the McCarthy estimate is always close to zero or even positive.

The last two rows of the table show a robustness check using an alternative measure of McCarthy intervention. Instead of using McCarthy speeches, we use William White's (1951, 1953) list of eight senate Republicans McCarthy helped elect, according to White's sources in the Senate. In 1950, these are Welker in Idaho, Dirksen in Illinois, Butler in Maryland, and Bennett in Utah. In 1952, these are Goldwater in Arizona, Purtell in Connecticut, Jenner in Indiana, and Barrett in Wyoming. Of these eight, the speech-based intervention measure includes five (it excludes Welker, Bennett, and Barrett). Unlike our speech measure, White's list of eight successful McCarthy interventions is of course post hoc, and so likely biased towards finding an effect. Nevertheless, when we use "White's eight" instead of the speech intervention measure, we find essentially the same result, as the table below shows.

	McCarthy intervention estimate (SE)
Main result reproduced from Table 2, Column 5	0.40 (1.96)
Prior pres. vote measured with one election	-0.26 (1.68)
Prior pres. vote measured with three elections	-0.06 (1.98)
Prior pres. vote measured with four elections	0.15 (1.97)
With SEs clustered by county	0.40 (0.97)
Excluding open-seat races	1.36 (1.78)
Using a simple dichotomy variable for candidate quality	1.42 (1.60)
Excluding county fixed effects	-0.65 (2.35)
Excluding only former Confederate states	0.30 (1.89)
Using NYT's William White list of eight successful interventions	-1.95(1.99)
... (with no controls except fixed effects)	-0.66(1.77)

## 2. Forecasting Model

<i>DV: County-level Democratic vote for Senate</i>	(1)	(2)
	Forecasting model (excludes 1950 and 1952)	Test of McCarthy intervention on residual from column 1
McCarthy intervention		-0.42 (2.74)
Incumbent	3.51*** (0.74)	
Appointed incumbent	-5.05* (2.73)	
Prior presidential vote (avg. of previous two elections)	0.16** (0.068)	
Real disposable income growth (election-year change, *-1 for Republican President)	0.48** (0.23)	
Real disposable income growth * Midterm indicator	-0.81 (0.51)	
Democratic President/midterm indicator (coded 1 midterm for with Democratic president, 0 presidential election, - 1 for midterm with Republican president)	-2.77*** (1.05)	
Constant	43.8*** (3.37)	-0.15 (0.51)
N	11,445	13,853
R-squared	0.617	0.007
SER	7.38	9.36

OLS estimates. Robust standard errors clustered at the state-year in parentheses in column 1. Observations are county years. We include a 1952 indicator in column 2. The forecasting model includes county fixed effects, so the McCarthy intervention variable tests whether McCarthy interventions were associated with a change within county/state in the residuals from the model in column 1. The data spans 1948-1970 and we noticed some sensitivity to the years included. \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1

### 3. List of Quotes

Quote	Source
<p>“He’s the sorriest senator up here. Can’t tie his goddam shoes. But he’s riding high now, he’s got people scared to death some Communist will strangle ‘em in their sleep, and anybody who takes him on before the fevers cool—well you don’t get in a pissin’ contest with a polecat”</p>	(Caro, 546)
<p>“The Wisconsin Republican gave the keynote address before the convention of the Wisconsin Republican Committee, whose 2,475 delegates broke in with applause eighteen times during his one hour speech”</p>	(Eckel, NYT 1950)
<p>"Newsweek proclaimed “Democrats Fume at McCarthy, But He Has Them Terrorized” (Newsweek, 20 August 1951, 19)"</p>	(Herman, 184)
<p>"McCarthyism," the Times wrote, "is simply today a very considerable force in the U.S. Congress the United States. And it is here to stay."</p>	(Herman, 184)
<p>"Christian Century, proclaimed that "whether we like it or not... The Wisconsin senator has become an influential factor in American life."</p>	(Herman, 184)
<p>"No fewer than five freshman Republicans, elected in 1950, readily admit that Mr. McCarthy's help was important to their victory"</p>	(Knowles, NYT 1952)
<p>"On the other hand, some Democratic candidates felt strongly the influence of McCarthy’s presence. Patrick Lucey, unsuccessful candidate for Congress in the Third District, thought that McCarthy was an important factor in his defeat. McCarthy had brought out a thousand people in the small town of Prairie du Chien and had branded Lucey a Commiecrat."</p>	(O’Brien, 105)
<p>"McCarthy’s primary concern was Connecticut, where two Senate seats, one of them Bill Benton’s, were up for grabs. Joe spent several days in CT, delighting the crowds with his skunk and chicken story and charging that Benton was worth a hundred million dollars to the Kremlin. According to Prescott Bush, McCarthy’s presence at a rally was enough to start a riot."</p>	(Oshinsky, 239)
<p>“In Illinois, Joe made a half dozen speeches in the Chicago area. He lashed out at Scott Lucas as one of those most responsible for the State Department whitewash. A vote for Everett Dirksen, he exclaimed, would be a prayer for America and a vote against Dean Acheson and the Comiecrat party.”</p>	(Reeves, 335)
<p>In Wisconsin, Joe traveled to more than a dozen cities, drawing large crowds wherever he went. Joe also flattered Walter Kohler, praised Senator Wiley, and urged the election of all Republicans.”</p>	(Reeves, 335)
<p>“In every contest where it was a major factor, Marquis Childs observed, “McCarthyism won”. Nixon won in California by 700,000 votes. Dirksen defeated Lucas with 300k. Taft won with 57.5 percent of the vote. Wiley and Kohler won in Wisconsin, as did Charles Kersten. In Pennsylvania, James Duff ousted majority whip Francis Myers. Wallace Bennett defeated Elbert Thomas in Utah. Capehart (IN) and Millikin in CO were reelected. Butler beat Tydings by “the largest majority that has ever been given a Republican senatorial candidate in the history of my state” boasted the winner.</p>	(Reeves, 344)
<p>“In a Las Vegas radio talk on behalf of Sen. George Molly Malone Joe labeled local newspaper editor Hank Greenspan- a foe of McCarran- an ex-communist. He meant to say ex-convict. The editor later told his attorney that Joe was drunk...”</p>	(Reeves, 441)

<p>"The elder Kennedy did ask McCarthy not to enter MA; moreover made a sizable contribution to McCarthy's campaign. McCarthy thought Lodge was hatching a plan against him, and swore not to lift a finger for his MA colleague. "I'm going to teach that bastard of a Lodge to suck eggs".</p>	<p>(Reeves, 443)</p>
<p>"The Chicago speech cost 75,000 to put on the air. Money was simply not a problem for the McCarthy campaign; it flowed into his campaign office, HQ , from all over the country. Urban Van Susteren later exclaimed, "There was money all over the place!" In December, the McCarthy Club reported expenditures of \$162,832.91 the largest amount spent on a single candidate by one state organization in many years."</p>	<p>(Reeves, 447)</p>
<p>McCarthy's most famous campaign speech of 1952 took place in Chicago and was carried nationally over 55 television stations and 550 radio stations. Without consulting Eisenhower, McCarthy intended to expose Stevenson. He paid for the network time himself with funds collected by a committee of businessmen headed by General Wood of Sears,Roebuck. In his speech delivered to a crowd of 1,700 most of whom had paid \$50 for dinner, McCarthy claimed to possess the coldly documented background of the Democratic presidential candidate. Northwestern Law professor Willard Pedrick checked the sources of McCarthy's speech and called it a "most amazing demonstration of studied inaccuracy".</p>	<p>(Reeves, 445–446)</p>
<p>"In Washington and in all the country west of Washington, [McCarthy] was a fertile innovator, a first-rate organizer and galvanizer of mobs, a skilled manipulator of public opinion, and something like a genius at that essential American strategy: publicity."</p>	<p>(Rovere, 10)</p>
<p>"Senator Joseph R. McCarthy (R., Wis.) last night stepped into the role of "keynoter" in the Maryland Republican campaign to unseat Senator Millard E. Tydings (D., Md.) in November. McCarthy attacked Tydings anew for his handling of the investigation into the Wisconsin Senator's charges of Communist penetration into the State Department. Tydings had reported to the Senate that McCarthy's charges were a hoax, and dismissed white washing allegation as "ridiculous."</p>	<p>(Ryan, NYT 1950)</p>
<p>"Joseph McCarthy, the Wisconsin farm boy who forgot to wipe his feet before going to the big city, was probably the most influential demagogue the United States has ever produced. From 1950 until the end of 1954 he held the Western world spellbound with his crusade to uncover domestic Communists."</p>	<p>(Sherril, NYT 1983)</p>
<p>"McCarthy was unable to substantiate his charges, but his speech had an amazing impact on American public opinion and for the brief period from 1950 to 1953 McCarthy was arguably the most powerful politician in United States."</p>	<p>(Smith and Davis, 204)</p>
<p>"by any standard, the most politically powerful first term Senator in [this] Congress"</p>	<p>(White, NYT 1951)</p>
<p>"The simple fact about Senator McCarthy--the profound fact of his well-demonstrated political success--is not overlooked in a political body"</p>	<p>(White, NYT 1953)</p>
<p>"Mr. McCarthy's friends say, with what seems on disinterested observation to be considerable justification, that in the last two years he has, at least to some extent, influenced the success at the polls of no less than eight present Senators."</p>	<p>(White, NYT 1953)</p>
<p>"And the Senate now knows what it then (after the 1950 election) suspected: Senator McCarthy is a very bad man to cross politically"</p>	<p>(White, NYT 1953)</p>

## Appendix Bibliography

- Caro, Robert. 2002. *Master of the Senate: The Years of Lyndon Johnson*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Eckel, George. 1950. "McCarthy, in Attack on Acheson, is Cheered by Wisconsin G.O.P." June 10. *New York Times*.
- Herman, Arthur. 2000. *Joseph McCarthy: Re-Examining the Life and Legacy of America's Most Hated Senator*. New York: Free Press.
- Knowles, Clayton. 1952. "McCarthy to Play Key Campaign Role: Whoever Republican Candidate May Be, the Senator Will Be Active on the Stump". April 27. *New York Times*.
- O'Brien, Michael. 1980. *McCarthy and McCarthyism in Wisconsin*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press.
- Oshinsky, D. M. 1983. *A Conspiracy So Immense: The World of Joe McCarthy*. New York: The Free Press.
- Reeves, Thomas 1982. *The Life and Times of Joe McCarthy: A Biography*. New York: Madison Books.
- Rovere, Richard H. 1959. *Senator Joe McCarthy*. New York: Harcourt, Brace.
- Ryan, Edward F. 1950. "McCarthy Enters Maryland Fight With Blast at Tydings" Sep. 23. *Washington Post*.
- Sherrill, Robert. 1983. "The Trajectory of a Bumbler". June 5. *New York Times Book Review*.
- Smith, J. H., & Davis, S. 2005. *The A to Z of the Cold War*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.
- White, William S. 1951. "McCarthy's Influence is Greater in the 82D; Two Problems Ahead for the New Congress." Jan. 7. *New York Times*.
- White, William S. 1953. "McCarthy Senate Power Now Deeply Entrenched." Jan. 17. *New York Times*.