

**Lemma 0.**

Let

$$d = \text{dist}(E, F)$$

One easily sees that a closed box with side lengths less than

$$s := \frac{d}{\sqrt{n}}$$

has diameter  $< d$ .

Note that, for any  $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ ,

$$m^*(A) = \inf \left\{ \sum_{j \in J} |B_j| \mid J \text{ countable, } B_j \text{ closed boxes} \right\}$$

Now let  $(B_j)_{j \in J}$  be a countable closed box cover of  $E \cup F$  such that

$$\sum_{j \in J} |B_j| < m^*(E \cup F) + \varepsilon$$

for some arbitrary  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Write

$$B_j = \prod_{i=1}^n [a_{ij}, b_{ij}]$$

for each  $j \in J$ , and partition each interval as

$$P_{ij} = \{a_{ij} = x_{ij0} < \cdots < x_{ijm_{ij}} = b_{ij}\}$$

with  $x_{ijk} - x_{ij(k-1)} < s$ . This allows us to cover  $B_j$  with sub-boxes of the form:

$$b_{jk_1 k_2 \dots k_n} = \prod_{i=1}^n [a_{ij(k_i-1)}, b_{ijk_i}]$$

each having diameter  $< d$ . Letting  $S_j$  be the set of all sub-boxes of  $B_j$ , we also have

$$\sum_{b \in S_j} |b| = |B_j|$$

For each  $j$ , define

$$S_{jE} = \{b \in S_j \mid b \cap E \neq \emptyset\}$$

and define  $S_{jF}$  similarly. Then clearly

$$\bigcup_{j \in J} S_{jE}$$

covers  $E$ , and similar for  $F$ . **But  $S_{jE}$  and  $S_{jF}$  are disjoint** because each box has diameter  $< d = \text{dist}(E, F)$ . This means that

$$\sum_{b \in S_{jE}} |b| + \sum_{b \in S_{jF}} |b| = \sum_{b \in S_{jE} \cup S_{jF}} |b|$$

Noting that  $S_{jE} \cup S_{jF} \subseteq S_j$ , we finally obtain

$$\begin{aligned} m^*(E \cup F) + \varepsilon &> \sum_{j \in J} |B_j| \\ &= \sum_{j \in J} \sum_{b \in S_j} |b| \\ &\geq \sum_{j \in J} \sum_{b \in S_{jE} \cup S_{jF}} |b| \\ &= \sum_{j \in J} \left( \sum_{b \in S_{jE}} |b| + \sum_{b \in S_{jF}} |b| \right) \\ &= \sum_{j \in J} \sum_{b \in S_{jE}} |b| + \sum_{j \in J} \sum_{b \in S_{jF}} |b| \\ &\geq m^*(E) + m^*(F) \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\varepsilon$  was arbitrary,

$$m^*(E \cup F) \geq m^*(E) + m^*(F)$$

By finite additivity,

$$m^*(E \cup F) \leq m^*(E) + m^*(F)$$

Comining,

$$m^*(E \cup F) = m^*(E) + m^*(F)$$

QED.

**Lemma 1.**

By monotonicity,

$$m^*(A) \leq \inf \{m^*(U) \mid U \supseteq A, U \text{ open}\}$$

Furthermore, letting  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $(B_j)_{j \in J}$  be a countable open box cover of  $A$  with

$$\sum_{j \in J} |B_j| < m^*(A) + \varepsilon$$

and letting  $U = \bigcup_{j \in J} B_j$ , we have

$$U \subseteq \bigcup_{j \in J} B_j$$

$$\begin{aligned} m^*(U) &\leq \sum_{j \in J} |B_j| \\ &< m^*(A) + \varepsilon \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\varepsilon > 0$  was arbitrary, this gives

$$\inf \{m^*(U) \mid U \supseteq A, U \text{ open}\} \leq m^*(A)$$

$$m^*(A) = \inf \{m^*(U) \mid U \supseteq A, U \text{ open}\}$$

**Lemma 2.**

Define

$$E = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} E_i$$

We are to show that  $E$  is measurable.

Let  $\varepsilon > 0$  and pick a sequence of positive numbers  $(\varepsilon_i)_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \varepsilon_i = \varepsilon$$

For each  $i$ , pick a  $U_i \supseteq E_i$  such that

$$m^*(U_i \setminus E_i) < \varepsilon_i$$

Define

$$U = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} U_i$$

To prove the lemma, we will show that

$$m^*(U \setminus E) < \varepsilon$$

First, we have

$$\begin{aligned} U \setminus E &= \bigcup_{i \in \mathbb{N}} U_i \setminus \bigcup_{i \in \mathbb{N}} E_i \\ &= \bigcup_{i \in \mathbb{N}} \left( U_i \setminus \bigcup_{i \in \mathbb{N}} E_i \right) \\ &\subseteq \bigcup_{i \in \mathbb{N}} (U_i \setminus E_i) \end{aligned}$$

By monotonicity and countable subadditivity:

$$\begin{aligned} m^*(U \setminus E) &\leq m^* \left( \bigcup_{i \in \mathbb{N}} (U_i \setminus E_i) \right) \\ &\leq \sum_{i \in \mathbb{N}} m^*(U_i \setminus E_i) \\ &< \sum_{i \in \mathbb{N}} \varepsilon_i \\ &= \varepsilon \end{aligned}$$

QED.

**Lemma 3.**

Since  $\mathbb{R}^n$  is covered by countably many unit cubes,  $A$  is a countable union of compact sets:

$$A = \bigcup_{(m_1, \dots, m_n) \in \mathbb{Z}^n} \left( A \cap \prod_{i=1}^n [m_i, m_i + 1] \right)$$

So we assume WLOG that  $A \subseteq [0, 1]^n$ .

Now we make two claims:

1. An open set is a union of countably many closed boxes with disjoint interiors.
2. Outer measure is countably super-additive on closed boxes with disjoint interiors.

First, we show that these claims imply Lemma 3.

Let  $U$  be the open set

$$U = (-0.1, 1.1)^n \setminus A$$

and let  $(B_i)_{i \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of closed boxes with disjoint interiors such that

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i = U$$

Such a sequence exists by Claim 1.

**Observation 1.** Let  $A \subseteq U' \subseteq A \cup U$ . Let

$$S = \{i \in \mathbb{N} \mid U' \cap B_i \neq \emptyset\}$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} U' \setminus A &\subseteq U \\ U' \setminus A &\subseteq \bigcup_{i \in S} B_i \\ m^*(U' \setminus A) &\leq \sum_{i \in S} m^*(B_i) \end{aligned}$$

**Observation 2.** By Claim 2,  $\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} m^*(B_i)$  is finite:

$$\infty > m^*(U) \geq m^*\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i\right) \geq \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} m^*(B_i)$$

Now note that, by compactness and Lebesgue number tactics, for each  $i$  there is a radius  $r_i > 0$  such that

$$\forall x \in B_i : B_r(x) \subseteq U$$

$$\forall a \in A : B_r(a) \cap B_i = \emptyset$$

( $B_r(x)$  is the open ball with radius  $r$  and center  $x$ .)

Fix some such  $r_i$  for each  $i$ .

Furthermore, there's a radius  $r > 0$  such that

$$\forall a \in A : B_r(a) \subseteq U$$

For each  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ , define

$$R_m = \min \{r, r_1, r_2, \dots, r_{m-1}\}$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} \forall a \in A : B_{R_m}(a) &\subseteq U \\ \forall a \in A \forall i < m : B_{R_m}(a) \cap B_i &= \emptyset \end{aligned}$$

Now let

$$U'_m = \bigcup_{a \in A} B_{R_m}(a)$$

$U'_m$  satisfies the hypothesis of **Observation 1**, and, letting  $S$  be as in **Observation 1**, we find that

$$\forall i \in S : i \geq m$$

This gives

$$m^*(U'_m \setminus A) \leq \sum_{i \in S} m^*(B_i) \leq \sum_{i=m}^{\infty} m^*(B_i)$$

Finally, let  $\varepsilon > 0$ . By **Observation 2**, there exists  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$\sum_{i=m}^{\infty} m^*(B_i) < \varepsilon$$

which means that  $U'_m$  is an open set containing  $A$  such that

$$m^*(U'_m \setminus A) < \varepsilon$$

Hence  $A$  is measurable.

We now prove Claims 1 and 2 to complete the proof.

**Claim 1.** *An open set is a union of countably many closed boxes with disjoint interiors.*

For any  $s > 0$  there is a set

$$T_s = \{s\langle m_1, \dots, m_n \rangle + [0, s]^n \mid m_i \in \mathbb{Z}\}$$

which can be said to tile  $\mathbb{R}^n$  using translates of  $[0, s]^n$  (with disjoint interiors). One might also say that its elements are cubes aligned with grid lines.

This set covers  $\mathbb{R}^n$ . This set is countable, so any subset of it is countable.

Let  $U$  be an open set.

We will fill  $U$  with closed cubes having power-of-two sidelengths and aligned with gridlines.

For each  $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$ , define

$$S_k = \left\{ b \in T_{2^{-k}} \mid b \subseteq U, b \not\subseteq \bigcup_{j < k} S_j \right\}$$

For example,

$$\begin{aligned} S_0 &= \{b \in T_1 \mid b \subseteq U\} \\ S_1 &= \left\{ b \in T_{\frac{1}{2}} \mid b \subseteq U, b \not\subseteq S_0 \right\} \\ S_2 &= \left\{ b \in T_{\frac{1}{4}} \mid b \subseteq U, b \not\subseteq S_0 \cup S_1 \right\} \\ &\dots \end{aligned}$$

**Observation 3.**

For any integers  $i, j \in \mathbb{N}_0$  with  $i \leq j$  and any subset  $S \subseteq T_{2^{-i}}$ , every box  $b$  in

$$\left\{ b \in T_{2^{-j}} \mid b \not\subseteq \bigcup S \right\}$$

has interior  $b^\circ$  disjoint from every  $b'^\circ$  for  $b' \in S$ . For example, the elements of  $S$  have disjoint interiors, and the elements of

$$S_\sigma := \bigcup_{k=0}^{\infty} S_k$$

have disjoint interiors.

Note also that  $S_\sigma$  is countable since each  $S_k$  is countable.

Clearly

$$\bigcup S_\sigma \subseteq U$$

Furthermore, we will see that

$$U \subseteq \bigcup S_\sigma$$

Indeed, since  $\bigcup_{k=0}^{\infty} T_{2^{-k}}$  has boxes with arbitrarily small diameter, it contains a box  $b$  with

$$b \subseteq U$$

$$u \in b$$

Taking  $b$  such a box with largest possible side length  $2^{-k}$ , we notice that

$$\forall b' \in \bigcup_{j < k} T_{2^{-j}} : u \notin b'$$

Hence

$$b \not\subseteq \bigcup_{j < k} S_j$$

Therefore

$$b \in S_k$$

$$u \in b \subseteq \bigcup S_\sigma$$

$$u \in \bigcup S_\sigma$$

Since  $u$  was arbitrary, we now obtain

$$U \subseteq \bigcup S_\sigma$$

$$U = \bigcup S_\sigma$$

Thus, we have finally written  $U$  as a countable union of closed boxes with disjoint interiors.

**Claim 2.** *Outer measure is countably super-additive on closed boxes with disjoint interiors.*

**Subclaim.** *Let  $(B_j)_{j \in J}$  be a finite sequence of closed boxes with disjoint interiors, and  $B'$  a closed box. Then  $m^*(B) \geq \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B' \cap B_j)$ .*

Let  $(B_j)_{j \in J}$  be a finite sequence of closed boxes with disjoint interiors, and  $B'$  a closed box.

Let  $E_i$  be the set of interval endpoints on the  $i^{\text{th}}$  dimension:

$$E_i = \{a'_i, b'_i\} \cup \bigcup_{j \in J} \{a_{ij}, b_{ij}\}$$

Let

$$B_j = \prod_{i=1}^n [a_{ij}, b_{ij}]$$

$$B = \prod_{i=1}^n [a'_i, b'_i]$$

For each  $i$ , let

$$a_i = \min(E_i)$$

$$b_i = \max(E_i)$$

$$P_i = E_i \cap [a_i, b_i]$$

We regard  $P_i$  as a partition of the interval  $[a_i, b_i]$ , writing

$$P_i = \{a_i = x_{i0} < \cdots < x_{it_i} = b_i\}$$

and we use these partitions to split  $B$  naturally into sub-boxes:

$$S = \left\{ \prod_{i=1}^n [x_{ik_i-1}, x_{ik_i}] \mid 1 \leq k_i \leq t_i \right\}$$

Clearly

$$|B| = \sum_{b \in S} |b|$$

For each  $i \in \{1, \dots, n\}$  and  $j \in J$  there is the sub-partition

$$P_{ij} = P_i \cap [a_{ij}, b_{ij}]$$

which partitions  $[a_{ij}, b_{ij}]$ .

We let

$$t_{ij} = \max(P_{ij})$$

$$r_{ij} = \min(P_{ij})$$

Now, for each  $j \in J$ , we take the natural set of sub-boxes

$$\begin{aligned} S_j &= \left\{ \prod_{i=1}^n [x_{ik_i-1}, x_{ik_i}] \mid r_{ij} \leq k_i \leq t_{ij} \right\} \\ &= \{b \in S \mid b \subseteq B_j\} \\ &= \{b \in S \mid b^\circ \cap B_j \neq \emptyset\} \end{aligned}$$

Clearly

$$|B_j| = \sum_{b \in S_j} |b|$$

Repeat the above constructions and observations for  $B'$  by defining  $P'_i$ , etc.

**Important bit:** for any  $j \in J$ ,  $S' \cap S_j$  covers  $B \cap B_j$ . Noting that the  $S_j$  are disjoint from



each other and from  $S'$ , we now see

$$\begin{aligned}
m^*(B') &= |B'| \\
&= \sum_{b \in S'} |b| \\
&= \sum_{b \in S' \setminus \bigcup_{j \in J} S_j} |b| + \sum_{b \in \bigcup_{j \in J} S_j} |b| \\
&\geq \sum_{b \in \bigcup_{j \in J} S_j} |b| \\
&= \sum_{j \in J} \sum_{b \in S_j} |b| \\
&\geq \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B' \cap B_j)
\end{aligned}$$

(The last “ $\geq$ ” is due to **Important bit**.)

This proves the subclaim.

Now let  $(B_j)_{j \in J}$  be a finite sequence of boxes, as before, and define

$$C = \bigcup_{j \in J} B_j$$

Pick a  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Pick a countable cover  $(B_k)_{k \in K}$  such that  $B_k$  are closed boxes and

$$\sum_{k \in K} |B_k| < m^*(C) + \varepsilon$$

For any  $k \in K$ , **Subclaim** tells us that

$$m^*(B_k) \geq \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B_k \cap B_j)$$

Noting that each  $B_k \cap B_j$  is itself a closed box, we construct a countable closed box cover

$$(B_k \cap B_j)_{k \in K}$$

for each  $j \in J$ . This gives

$$m^*(B_j) \leq \sum_{k \in K} m^*(B_k \cap B_j)$$

Summing over  $J$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{j \in J} m^*(B_j) &\leq \sum_{j \in J} \sum_{k \in K} m^*(B_k \cap B_j) \\
&= \sum_{k \in K} \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B_k \cap B_j) \\
&\leq \sum_{k \in K} m^*(B_k) \\
&< m^*(C) + \varepsilon
\end{aligned}$$

Since this holds for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , we find

$$m^*(C) \geq \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B_j)$$

Indeed, for any  $E \supseteq C = \bigcup_{j \in J} B_j$ ,

$$m^*(E) \geq \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B_j)$$

So, letting  $(B_l)_{l \in L}$  be a countable sequence of closed boxes and  $A$  their union, we see that for any finite  $J \subseteq L$ ,

$$A \supseteq \bigcup_{j \in J} B_j$$
$$m^*(A) \geq \sum_{j \in J} m^*(B_j)$$

Therefore

$$m^*(A) \geq \sum_{l \in L} m^*(B_l)$$

This finally proves our claim.

QED.

**Lemma 4.**

Let  $(a_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of positive numbers with infimum 0.  
For each  $n$ , let  $U_n$  be an open set containing  $E$  such that

$$m^*(U_n \setminus E) < a_n$$

Then each  $U_n^c$  is closed and

$$m^*\left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} U_n \setminus E\right) = 0$$

Note now that

$$E^c = \left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} U_n^c\right) \cup \left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} U_n \setminus E\right)$$

Since  $E^c$  is a countable union of measurable sets, it is measurable.